



Project acronym: TRACE  
Project title: Trafficking as A Criminal Enterprise  
Grant number: 607669  
Programme: Seventh Framework Programme – Security Research  
Objective: SEC-2013.6.1-3  
Contract type: Coordination and support action  
Start date of project: 01 May 2014  
Duration: 24 months  
Website: [www.trace-project.eu](http://www.trace-project.eu)

## **Deliverable 6.1:**

# Review of EU Projects - Promising Practices in Combatting Human Trafficking

Author(s): G. Bjallerstedt, (CBSS TF-THB)  
Aija Lulle, (CBSS TF-THB)  
Vineta Polatside, (CBSS TF-THB)  
Maximilian Nicolae, (ANITP)  
Mirela Saykovska, (AAF)

Dissemination level: Public  
Deliverable type: Final  
Version: 1  
Submission date: 30<sup>th</sup> March 2015

## Change Records

Issue	Date	Description	Author (Company)
0.1	25.2.2015	Draft Report Completed	G. Bjallerstedt (CBSS TF-THB)
0.2	2-16.3.2015	Internal Review	Adelina Tamas (ANITP) Aija Lulle (CBSS TF-THB) Amy Weatherburn (VUB) Hayley Watson (TRI) Mirela Saykovska (Animus) Suzanne Hoff (La Strada) Vinetta Polatside (CBSS TF-THB)
0.3	20.3.2015	External Review	Liliana Sorrentino (Independent Expert on THB)
0.4	25.3.2015	Final Revision and Submission	G. Bjallerstedt (CBSS TF-THB)

Chapter	Main authors responsible	Contributors
Chapters 1-3	G. Bjallerstedt ( <i>Introduction, Promising Practices, Challenges</i> )	
Chapter 4	Aija Lulle ( <i>Ireland, Poland</i> ) G. Bjallerstedt ( <i>Finland, France, Sweden, the Netherlands, COMBAT, REACT</i> ) Maximilian Nicolae ( <i>Romania</i> ) Mirela Saykovska ( <i>Bulgaria</i> ) Vinetta Polatside ( <i>ADSTRINGO</i> )	Adelina Tamas ( <i>Romania</i> )
Chapter 5	G. Bjallerstedt	

## Table of Contents

<b>Executive summary</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2 Promising practices</b>	<b>8</b>
3.1 <i>Identification, protection and assisting Victims of Trafficking</i>	8
3.2 <i>Stepping up the prevention of trafficking in human beings</i>	9
3.3 <i>Increase Prosecution of Traffickers</i>	10
3.4 <i>Enhance coordination and cooperation among key actors and policy coherence</i>	10
3.5 <i>Increase knowledge of and effective response to emerging concerns related to all forms of trafficking in human beings</i>	11
<b>3 Challenges Remain</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>4 Illustrative examples of project reviewed</b>	<b>14</b>
4.1 <i>BULGARIA establishes network of specialized legal professionals to improve trafficked persons' access to justice</i>	14
4.2 <i>FINLAND proactively identifies and protects asylum seekers victims of human trafficking, including unaccompanied minors</i>	17
4.3 <i>FRANCE strengthens national network for the protection and safe accommodation of trafficked persons</i>	20
4.4 <i>IRELAND protects the rights of migrant workers victims of labour exploitation</i>	22
4.5 <i>POLAND tackles human trafficking among the residents of border and tourist communities</i>	25
4.6 <i>ROMANIA raises awareness among youth through creativity and sports</i>	28
4.7 <i>SWEDEN embraces a victim-centred approach to interagency cooperation and coordination</i>	31
4.8 <i>The NETHERLANDS detects and deters human trafficking through innovative investigatory tactics</i>	35
4.9 <i>ADSTRINGO: Addressing Trafficking in Human Beings for Labour Exploitation through Improved Partnerships, Enhanced Diagnostics and Intensified Organisational Approaches</i>	38
4.10 <i>COMBAT: Tackling Human Trafficking in Bulgaria, Lithuania and the UK</i>	41
4.11 <i>REACT: Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, and Romania</i>	44
<b>5 List of additional Projects Reviewed</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>ACRONYMS</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>55</b>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**T**rafficking as A Criminal Enterprise (TRACE) is a transnational project, funded by the EU, in support of Member States and other stakeholders working to disrupt and combat trafficking in human beings. TRACE aims to provide a full account of the human trafficking industry by developing a contemporary understanding of human trafficking in Europe. Thus far, research conducted under the auspices of TRACE has described the changing nature of the geographical routes, *modus operandi* and phases of trafficking; examined the specific characteristics of the different actors involved in trafficking; analysed how political and socio-economic external factors have shaped the human trafficking industry; and explored how technology is being used for and against trafficking.<sup>1</sup>

Under the auspices of TRACE, the Council of the Baltic Sea States Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings conducted a desk review of existing European project on THB resulting in this report of promising practices by EU Member States. The report finds that significant progress has been achieved with regards to the implementation of projects tackling human trafficking in Europe.

The added value offered by a review of existing promising practices in addressing human trafficking in Europe lies in the timely and pragmatic information contained herein, enabling Member States to better conceptualize and more effectively execute their programmatic interventions against human trafficking, interventions which may come in response to recent shifts in national and EU policies and strategies prompted by the evolving nature of human trafficking.

The initiatives highlighted in the report demonstrate how some Member States are actively building on existing strengths towards the improved protection of victims' rights during criminal proceedings; greater awareness among at-risk groups such as unaccompanied minors, asylum-seekers, migrant workers and youths; focused public education campaigns in border towns and coastal communities; formalized inter-agency cooperation based on the victim-centred approach; innovative investigation and prosecution tactics; and increased knowledge-sharing among stakeholders on the modalities of trafficking for labour and sexual exploitation, including child trafficking.

The report is intended to be a practical document. It is envisaged as a contribution to the existing discourse among Member States on how to re-invigorate and intensify efforts to dismantle the human trafficking criminal network.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Trafficking as A Criminal Enterprise (TRACE)* is transnational research project funded by the European

## 1 INTRODUCTION

### *Background*

The European Union's legal and policy framework to combat trafficking in human beings is today defined by the EU Directive<sup>2</sup> and Strategy<sup>3</sup> in which EU Member States have been called upon to reinvigorate their counter-trafficking responses within five priority areas:

- A. Identifying, protecting and assisting victims of trafficking,
- B. Stepping up the prevention of trafficking in human beings,
- C. Increased prosecution of traffickers,
- D. Enhanced coordination and cooperation among key actors and policy coherence,
- E. Increased knowledge of and effective response to emerging concerns related to all forms of trafficking in human beings.

**TR**afficking as **A** Criminal **E**nterprise (TRACE) is an EU-funded transnational project in support of Member States and other stakeholders working to disrupt and combat trafficking in human beings through focused research, policy analysis, data consolidation and information dissemination.<sup>4</sup>

TRACE project partner, Council of the Baltic Sea States Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings (CBSS TF-THB)<sup>5</sup>, was tasked with conducting a desk review of projects exemplifying current trends and practices among EU Member States in tackling trafficking in human beings.

Based on an analysis of the information compiled, and guided by the five priority areas identified by the EU for Member States, a series of promising practices, lessons learned and challenges were extracted and are highlighted in this TRACE report. The report also includes summarized programmatic information on sample projects from eight Member States and three multi-country initiatives. Furthermore, the report contains a list of additional interesting projects reviewed for this task.

### *Methodology*

Research conducted was extensive, involving the desk review of over 60 EU projects,

---

<sup>2</sup> European Parliament and Council of the European Union, 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, April 2011.

<sup>3</sup> European Commission, *The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012 - 2016*, Com (2012) 286 final, 2012.

<sup>4</sup> TRACE (Grant No. 607669) is a two-year transnational research project launched in May 2014 and funded by the EU Seventh Framework Research Programme. TRACE consortium partners include Vrije University (Belgium), Tilburg University (Netherlands), Cyprus Police, National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (Romania), International La Strada Association (Netherlands), Animus Association Foundation (Bulgaria), Trilateral Research and Consulting (UK), and Council of Baltic Sea States Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings (Sweden). See, [www.trace-project.eu](http://www.trace-project.eu)

<sup>5</sup> The Council of the Baltic Sea States (CBSS) is comprised of 11 countries from the Baltic Sea Region as well as the European Commission and provides its ministerial representatives with an inter-governmental platform for regional cooperation. The CBSS was established in 1992 and has a permanent secretariat based in Stockholm. The Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings (TF-THB) is an expert group composed of government representatives from a variety of ministries from the eleven Member States as well as a representative of the Office of the EU Anti – Trafficking Coordinator. The CBSS TF-THB is mandated to address all forms of trafficking in human beings. See, [www.cbs.org](http://www.cbs.org)

national and transnational, ongoing and completed.<sup>6</sup> Project information reviewed consisted of literature and reports issued by academia, EU institutions and agencies, governments, non-government organizations, media, intergovernmental organizations, and donor entities. General online information accessible on various websites was also reviewed.

The pool of projects reviewed included submissions by TRACE partner organizations, a multi-sector multidisciplinary team of specialists on issues of human trafficking. TRACE project partners Animus Foundation Association and Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP) contributed to this report with exemplary sample projects. The CBSS TF-THB delegates from Latvia, Norway and Sweden also submitted suggestions.

### ***Definitions***

A project for the purpose of this review is broadly defined to include an activity, approach, experience, initiative, practice, method, model or process.

A promising practice for the purpose of this review is a project that has been implemented and can show immediate positive results (quick impact), despite the project's short life span, which on average was between 1 to 3 years.

### ***Selection Criteria***

The 30 promising practices extracted from the information reviewed were based on the following criteria:

- ✓ Objectives defined by the project are in line with the EU framework against human trafficking;
- ✓ Confirmed preliminary success as evidenced by public recognition, accolades, notoriety, etc.;
- ✓ Qualities of innovativeness and forward-thinking incorporated into the project design;
- ✓ Potential for customized replication at the national or regional level;
- ✓ Exemplifies a current or emerging trend in trafficking in human beings;
- ✓ Speaks to conclusions identified in research conducted by TRACE with regards to the challenges in tackling the human trafficking criminal network.

### ***Limitations***

The review is limited in time and scope. The desk review was conducted between November and December 2014. Data consolidation, analysis and drafting took place January through February 2015.

The information consolidated in this report does not purport to provide a comprehensive nor exhaustive review of anti-trafficking projects implemented ever since human trafficking as a global problem entered the international arena with the introduction of the UN Palermo Protocol in 2000.<sup>7</sup> Rather, the information reflects a select sample of promising practices by EU Member States in which the EU framework against human trafficking, and in particular the EU Directive and its Strategy,<sup>8</sup> has been translated into pragmatic and innovative initiatives on the ground.

---

<sup>6</sup> Time reference: EU and national projects, completed or currently underway, since the fall of the Berlin wall.

<sup>7</sup> UN General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 15 November 2000.

<sup>8</sup> See supra notes 1 and 2.

The average operational time-frame for each project reviewed was 1 to 3 years, with the exception of two initiatives presented in this report, France's AcSé project and the Netherland's barrier model, both have been in operation longer than three years. Official project evaluation reports (e.g., donor reports, evaluation reports, impact assessments) whether internally or externally conducted, were not always available during the desk review period, either because the information was not publicly available, the information did not exist, or the project evaluation process was pending and not yet available.

Onsite field visits and first-hand interviews were not part of the desk review process for this report.

## 2 PROMISING PRACTICES

The 30 promising practices highlighted in this section were extracted from the literature analysed. The promising practices listed below were divided into five priority areas in which the Strategy calls upon EU Member States to give focused attention and increase levels of activity<sup>9</sup>:

- A. Identifying, protecting and assisting victims of trafficking,
- B. Stepping up the prevention of trafficking in human beings,
- C. Increased prosecution of traffickers,
- D. Enhanced coordination and cooperation among key actors and policy coherence,
- E. Increased knowledge of and effective response to emerging concerns related to all forms of trafficking in human beings.

Preliminary research, including research conducted by TRACE, confirms that among the key challenges experienced by Member States in addressing human trafficking are low levels of victim identification; limited access by victims to information and assistance; inconsistent application of methodologies and standards in terms of victim protection; poor knowledge of and attention to the evolving nature of human trafficking in all its forms; and decreased levels of prosecution.<sup>10</sup>

Thus, Member States in the process of designing and implementing anti-trafficking initiatives aimed at addressing these priority areas, are invited to review and consider the following promising practices highlighted in this TRACE report.

### 3.1 IDENTIFICATION, PROTECTION AND ASSISTING VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING

- Expand the reach of assistance and support programs to include presumed victims and at-risk persons seeking to escape from potentially risky circumstances.
- Standardize national procedures for the identification and protection of asylum-seekers who may be victims of human trafficking, particularly among unaccompanied minors.
- Providing migrant workers with information, in their own language, pertaining to labour law, collective agreements, healthcare services, immigration procedures and referrals to assistance services for victims of labour exploitation.
- Formally register domestic workers employed by foreign diplomats (or employees of international organizations). The entity for a national registration of domestic workers in a country can vary; in one example, registration of domestic workers took place through the Protocol Office of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the host country.

---

<sup>9</sup> See supra note 2.

<sup>10</sup> European Commission, *Mid-term Report on the Implementation of the EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings*, COM (2014) 635 final, 2014. See also, European Commission, *The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012 - 2016*, Com (2012) 286 final, 2012; TRACE, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014; and TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

- Require the foreign embassy (or international organization) to become engaged in the contractual processes and employment conditions by which their diplomats employ and treat household staff working in their private homes. For example, the employer could be required to deposit the domestic worker's salary directly into a local bank account in the country of employment.
- Address the training needs and mental health concerns of front-line professionals working with trafficked persons in order to maintain a certain quality of service.
- Develop and implement National and Transnational Referral Mechanisms, key tools towards the consistent application of methodologies and standards in the protection of victim's rights.<sup>11</sup>

### 3.2 STEPPING UP THE PREVENTION OF TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS

- Empower at-risk and vulnerable persons through leadership development and peer mentoring, because behavioural change among young people takes place through peer-to-peer interaction promoting the desired (changed) behaviour.
- Customize message through different conduits in order to reach the targeted audience. Audiences are diverse (language, age, cultural, political, socio-economic, education, etc.), requiring the message to also be tailored in response to the target audience.
- Employ social media channels and other modern digital methods (e.g., multimedia art) to communicate with youth and young adults. Add a knowledge-sharing component to the project's communication strategy (social media, website profiles, blog sites) so as to mainstream the message into public dialogue of the desired target group.
- Share the stories of survivors; and, also share the stories of failed abusive and deceptive recruitment attempts, doing so will strengthen understanding of contributing vulnerability factors, increase public responsiveness to the message and empower other trafficked persons by allowing them to envisage an alternative.
- Consider expanding the target group for prevention work beyond the conventional ones, some examples include tourists visiting resort locations, border town residents, language schools and school administrators.
- Introduce user-friendly guidelines for companies and recruitment agencies clarifying the national law on labour exploitation and their legal obligations towards workers, particularly in sectors at-risk of being involved (intentionally or unintentionally) in labour exploitation, i.e., agriculture, construction, domestic work.

---

<sup>11</sup> "These mechanisms should describe procedures to better identify, refer, protect and assist victims and include all relevant public authorities and civil society... The roles and responsibility of all those involved should be clearly defined." European Commission, *The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012 - 2016*, 19 June 2012, Com (2012) 286 final, 2012, pp6.

### **3.3 INCREASE PROSECUTION OF TRAFFICKERS**

- Enlist private entities as partners in order to improve their ability to detect potential instances of human trafficking, and moreover to learn how to erect barriers where possible to prevent it from happening. Examples of private entities at-risk of facilitating the operation of human trafficking may include taxi companies, housing rental agents, and recruitment agencies, etc.
- Develop innovative investigatory practices by understanding and uncovering the links between the illicit and mainstream flow of proceeds from the exploitation of persons.
- Impact structural change within the criminal justice system through sustainable and customised training programs aimed at law enforcement officers, legal professionals, and most notably the judiciary.
- Institutionalise local and regional platforms for criminal justice system professionals to exchange good practices and lessons learned on the investigation and prosecution of trafficking cases.
- Maintain a victim-centred approach in the interaction between trafficked persons and the criminal justice system. Irrespective of whether the victim has chosen to participate in legal proceedings, s/he has the right to social and legal support, and their safety and wellbeing should be guaranteed at all times.

### **3.4 ENHANCE COORDINATION AND COOPERATION AMONG KEY ACTORS AND POLICY COHERENCE**

- Projects engaging a large number of partners and covering a wide geographical scope can achieve its objectives successfully, if the roles and responsibilities have been well defined in advance, otherwise the rollout of multiple activities and the coordination of multiple partners can be overwhelming during the implementation phase of the project. The strategic selection of partners during the brainstorming phase of the project can also impact, positively or negatively, the success of the project.
- Multi-country approach: running parallel project activities in the source, destination and/or transit countries, in partnership with local counterparts in the project countries.
- Regional programming approach: implementing a multi-level approach to project activities by which stakeholders are engaged horizontally and vertically (similarly to the EU's multilevel approach to governance).
- Create partnerships with less traditional actors that may come in contact with victims of labour exploitation, for example when tackling labour exploitation, the project should also target labour inspectorates, employers and trade unions, recruitment agencies, tax authorities, etc.
- Develop memoranda of understanding or similar localised coordination tools to formalise and detail the cooperation between law enforcement and civil society actors involved in trafficking cases.

- Implement National and Transnational Referral Mechanisms (NRMs and TRMs)<sup>12</sup>, both critical tools towards policy coherence and enhanced cooperation and coordination among state and non-state actors involved.

### **3.5 INCREASE KNOWLEDGE OF AND EFFECTIVE RESPONSE TO EMERGING CONCERNS RELATED TO ALL FORMS OF TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS**

- Require projects to conduct an external impact evaluation, or similar activity, to effectively measure impact achieved that is directly or indirectly attributed to the project.
- Give adequate attention, in terms of initiatives developed, to other known forms of exploitation, such as cannabis cultivation, state benefit fraud, illegal adoption, sham marriages and forced begging.
- Continue to encourage initiatives implemented in partnership with academia, think tanks and research institutions.
- Translate into concrete actions results from knowledge-sharing forums and up-to-date research. In doing so, project designs will more likely address the individual country context particularities and the evolving nature of human trafficking.

---

<sup>12</sup> See supra note 8; and also, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), *Guidelines for the Development of a Transnational Referral Mechanism for Trafficked Persons: South-Eastern Europe*, 2009; and also, OSCE, *National Referral Mechanisms: Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons, A Practical Guide*, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, 2004.

### 3 CHALLENGES REMAIN

This report finds that much has been done with regards to the development and implementation of innovative interventions to combat trafficking in human beings in Europe. That is to say, that while the human trafficking criminal network has evolved with time, programmatic responses by Member States have also adapted accordingly.

Nonetheless, this report further concludes that despite advances made in addressing this human rights crime, Member States continue to face a host of programmatic challenges, among which include the following most prominently observed gaps and weaknesses.

- Reaching beyond the symptoms of the problem, and attacking the root causes of exploitation by addressing existing gaps in access to education and economic opportunities. Concretely, stepping up societal responses to discrimination, inequality, unemployment and marginalised poverty.
- Holding governments accountable for the negligible and corrupt practices of its public officials who endanger the security of victim-witnesses, jeopardize counter-trafficking efforts by law enforcement, and ultimately deny trafficked persons their right to seek effective remedy.
- Changing community attitudes about human trafficking (the shamed victim, the rich *lover boy*, the revered smuggler, etc.). One promising step in the right direction is to acknowledge the critical role played by community leaders, agents of change, social-cultural norms and practices. Another step is to empower communities to detect and disrupt the human trafficking criminal network at its various stages.
- Creating the conditions under which facilitators of human trafficking, especially the private sector would be willing to become engaged and collaborate against trafficking.
- Reintegrating survivors of human trafficking (former victims) in countries of origin and destination by bolstering existing victim reintegration programs, with a focus on securing job opportunities and demand-driven job skills training.
- Building the capacity of stakeholders to conduct research, particularly in countries of origin, which tend to have less resources and experience available for research of this kind.
- Measuring the longer-term structural impact attributed to the project is often not possible namely due to the short life span of the average counter-trafficking project, or donor funds for an impact evaluation were not allotted for in the project budget.
- Increasing efforts at sustaining project objectives by linking into existing relevant frameworks and mechanisms. For instance, incorporating lessons on the prevention of human trafficking into the school education curriculum, or integrating specialised human trafficking courses into the curriculum of professional academies and training institutions.

- Improving the protection, support and rehabilitation offered to child victims of human trafficking, including foreign unaccompanied minors.
- Responding to the complicated and multifaceted demand-side of human trafficking, in all its forms.

## 4 ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLES OF PROJECT REVIEWED

Out of approximately 60 initiatives reviewed, this report presents the following national and transnational initiatives as illustrative examples of interventions by Member States demonstrating various advances made and lessons learned in the fight against human trafficking. Furthermore, an additional selection of projects reviewed is listed in Section 6 of this report.<sup>13</sup>

### 4.1 BULGARIA ESTABLISHES NETWORK OF SPECIALIZED LEGAL PROFESSIONALS TO IMPROVE TRAFFICKED PERSONS' ACCESS TO JUSTICE

#### *Background*

Bulgaria continues to be among the top five EU Member States with the most nationals identified as trafficking victims within the EU.<sup>14</sup> Bulgaria is mainly a source country, but also a transit and destination country, for sexual exploitation, forced labour, forced criminality and forced begging.<sup>15</sup> Most notably ethnic-Roma persons originating from Bulgaria are regularly trafficked internally and transnationally into forced prostitution, forced begging and forced criminality (e.g., petty theft).<sup>16</sup>

The EU and national legislation protects the human rights of trafficked persons, including among others, the right to be treated with respect and dignity, right to information, right to decide whether or not to cooperate with law enforcement, right to privacy protection, right to a reflection period, right to witness protection, right not to be punished or prosecuted for status-related offenses, right to temporary residency status, repatriation and reintegration. In addition and specifically in Bulgaria, trafficked persons have the right to a minimal number of interrogations, right to be questioned in a “mirror room”, and the right to financial compensation by the state. Furthermore, Bulgaria provides trafficked persons with a crisis intervention hotline, emergency shelter, psycho-social services, skills development programs, free legal aid and representation in court.

Despite the availability of a national and EU framework on the rights of trafficked persons, protecting their rights during pre-trial investigation, court proceedings and post-trial remains a challenge in Bulgaria, and in a number of other EU Member States.<sup>17</sup> Proper legal support is necessary, for example when the victim is participating in a criminal proceeding as a victim-witness; accessing her/his right to a reflection period and temporary residence permit;

---

<sup>13</sup> As previously stated, the scope of this report is limited and does not purport to offer a comprehensive nor exhaustive review of all anti-trafficking projects in the EU region.

<sup>14</sup> European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>15</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Bulgaria*, GRETA, 2014.

<sup>16</sup> In Bulgaria, the ethnic Roma community constitutes approximately 10% of the total Bulgarian population, out of which a significant number is unemployed and living under the poverty line. In one study, over 60% of the Roma trafficked persons interviewed had been trafficked to another EU Member State. European Roma Rights Centre, *Breaking the Silence Report*, 2011, pp 101-105. See also, European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>17</sup> Dobreva, Natasha, *Country Report: Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria*, Animus Association Foundation, 2013. See also, TRACE, *Report on the relevant aspects of the Trafficking Act and its possible evolution in response to Law Enforcement*, 2015.

pursuing compensation for damages in a civil proceeding.<sup>18</sup> Equally important is the practical support to which a trafficked person is entitled to while cooperating in the judicial process, such as ensuring that measures are in place ensuring the privacy and personal security of the victim (e.g., closed-door hearings, police escorts, ban on photographing and videotaping, personal data protection).

The participation of trafficked persons in the criminal justice system has often led to the re-traumatization of the victim.<sup>19</sup> A common challenge faced by trafficked persons identified in Bulgaria is access to legal assistance and representation. Several contributing factors continue to hinder the ability of trafficked persons to access legal assistance, for example, the inability of victims to trust law enforcement;<sup>20</sup> inability to comprehend the legal system; uninformed or misinformed about his/her legal rights; complexities related to the victim-determination process and related assistance eligibility; poor competency level of the legal assistance with regards to issues of human trafficking.<sup>21</sup> At times, law enforcement and legal professionals in the process of investigating and prosecuting trafficking cases, may ignore or simply forget their obligations, as state officials, to protect the legal rights of trafficking victims.<sup>22</sup>

The existence of corruption among public officials is another hinder to a victim's access to justice and subsequent prosecution of the trafficker. Despite a legal revision in 2013 to increase the penalty for public officials convicted of trafficking, corruption among officials in Bulgaria remains a serious issue of concern in the government's effort to combat human trafficking. Particular cases of corruption disrupting prosecution efforts, involve police officers allegedly leaking information to traffickers about ongoing investigations, or police officers allegedly directly involved in the human trafficking network.<sup>23</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

Bulgaria's project, ***Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria, Romania and Slovakia with Emphasis on Legal Support – A Human Rights-Based Approach*** focuses on establishing a network accessible to victims of criminal justice system professionals trained to effectively protect the legal rights of trafficked persons under the relevant applicable domestic and EU laws.<sup>24</sup> The project is a 3 year initiative (2012-2015) financed by the EU and implemented through a partnership between five civil society organizations in three partner countries: Bulgaria, Romania and Slovakia.

---

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid. Secondary victimization is a common experience among trafficked victims when coming into contact with law enforcement and/or participating in a legal proceeding.

<sup>21</sup> A number of court cases included in the research analysis per country: Bulgaria (14), Slovakia (5), Romania (1,486). In Bulgaria, there were no victims who applied for legal aid or who had been legally represented among the 14 court cases reviewed. Dobрева, Natasha, *Country Report: Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria*, Animus Association Foundation, 2013.

<sup>22</sup> This is referred to as the victim-centred approach, a process by which those involved in the judicial system protect the legal rights of the victim. Both the EU Directive and Strategy call upon Member States to utilize this approach in tackling human trafficking.

<sup>23</sup> In 2013, the government amended its anti-trafficking legislation to increase the penalty for public officials convicted of trafficking. See, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Bulgaria*, 2014.

<sup>24</sup> Project partners: Netherlands Helsinki Committee, Animus Association Foundation (Bulgaria), Caritas Ruse (Bulgaria), Association for the Development of Alternative Practices for Education and Reintegration, ADPARE (Romania), Pro Refugio Association (Romania) and Human Rights League (Slovakia). See also, [http://www.animusassociation.org/?page\\_id=1033&lang=en](http://www.animusassociation.org/?page_id=1033&lang=en)

The project's research component has consolidated and disseminated research-based analysis on the situation of trafficked persons and their access to justice in the three partner countries.<sup>25</sup> The project's target group includes professionals and civil society organisations tasked with providing assistance, counselling and representation before, during and after legal proceedings.<sup>26</sup>

As part of the project activities in Bulgaria, training was organized for 25 social workers<sup>27</sup>, from Sofia and other Bulgarian cities, on the rights of victims under Bulgarian legislation. Training was organized for 22 Bulgarian lawyers on how to communicate with a traumatised victim of human trafficking and on issues relevant to the prosecution of trafficking cases, including identification of bottlenecks in the criminal justice system.

A forum was organized where the targeted professionals exchanged lessons learned and good practices in investigating and prosecuting cases of human trafficking in Bulgaria. In the longer-term, the project envisages monitoring Bulgarian court cases of human trafficking.

### **Lessons Learned**

- ✓ Scarcity of competent legal assistance and representation accessible to trafficked persons in Bulgaria.
- ✓ Motivating a trafficked person to testify or participate in the criminal justice system remains a difficult and complicated process.
- ✓ Trafficked persons, and especially those who have been trafficked more than once, are in the most vulnerable psychological state; some demonstrate serious psychiatric problems.
- ✓ Members of the legal professional community often lack the sensitivity to communicate effectively with trafficking victims. Legal professionals would also benefit from courses on victimization and victim trauma psychology.
- ✓ Bulgarian prosecutors and judges should also be sensitised as to the victim-centred approach. Concretely, all relevant actors involved in the criminal justice system should be targeted for specialised training because lawyers alone cannot make the necessary difference within the criminal justice system.

### **Promising Practices**

- Establishment of a network of criminal justice professionals specialized on protecting the rights of trafficked persons and sensitised in communicating effectively with victim-witnesses.
- Creation of knowledge-sharing opportunities for criminal justice professionals involved in the investigation and prosecution of human trafficking cases.
- Conducting evidence-based research to better inform future initiatives.

---

<sup>25</sup> Dobreva, Natasha, *Country Report: Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria*, Animus Association Foundation, 2013.

<sup>26</sup> Ibid.

<sup>27</sup> For example, social workers in civil society organizations, counselling centres, crisis centres, legal aid centres and shelters.

## 4.2 FINLAND PROACTIVELY IDENTIFIES AND PROTECTS ASYLUM SEEKERS VICTIMS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING, INCLUDING UNACCOMPANIED MINORS

### *Background*

A significant percentage of trafficking victims identified in Finland were detected by the Finnish asylum authorities among Finland's pool of applicants for asylum.<sup>28</sup> Finland is a country of transit and destination, primarily for sexual and labour exploitation of children, women and men.<sup>29</sup>

Trafficking victims identified in Finland are generally nationals of Belarus, Estonia, Caucasus, China, Latvia, Lithuania, Moldova, Nigeria, Thailand and Ukraine.<sup>30</sup> Human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation in Finland has been reported in sectors such as berry-picking, domestic service, cleaning, gardening, restaurant and transport.<sup>31</sup>

In Finland, asylum-seekers and in particular asylum-seekers who are unaccompanied minors are at high risk of being trafficked.<sup>32</sup> Asylum-seekers fleeing conditions of political turmoil, conflict and war are more likely at-risk of becoming victims of human trafficking because of vulnerability factors while in transit or in the country of destination, such as being unemployed, indebted and traumatised.<sup>33</sup> Asylum-seekers are often without family or a social support network, unable to communicate due to language barriers, and remain insecure about their immigration status while undergoing the international protection procedure in the country of destination.<sup>34</sup>

The EU's international protection framework, the asylum *acquis*, obligates Member States to improve identification procedures and extend more assistance to vulnerable persons such as trafficking victims and unaccompanied children.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> European Migration Network Study, *Identification of victims of trafficking in human beings in international protection and forced return procedures*, 2014; see also, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *The Thematic Study on Child Trafficking in Finland*, 2008; and European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>29</sup> Council of Europe GRETA, *Reply from Finland to the Questionnaire for the Evaluation of the Implementation of the Council of European Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties*, 2014. See also, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland*, Report 2014.

<sup>30</sup> A trend observed by law enforcement in Finland is the emergence of dozens of Nigerian women suspected of being victims of sexual exploitation. The women entered Finland using false travel documents or Spanish or Italian residence permits. They have been observed working as prostitutes in several Finnish neighbourhoods. The authorities suspect the women of being trafficking victims because the women have no bargaining power in whether to accept the exploitative conditions under which they are presumably forced to work while in Finland. See, Ombudsman of Minorities, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland*, Report 2014, pp. 70.

<sup>31</sup> Ombudsman for Minorities, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland*, Report 2014, pp. 23. See also, Council of Europe GRETA, *Reply from Finland to the Questionnaire for the Evaluation of the Implementation of the Council of European Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties*, 2014; and, Sorrentino, L., Jokinen, A., *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), Council of the Baltic Sea States, 2014.

<sup>32</sup> European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *The Thematic Study on Child Trafficking in Finland*, 2008.

<sup>33</sup> European Migration Network Study, *Identification of Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings in International Protection and Forced Return Procedures*, 2014.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid*, pp 20.

<sup>35</sup> The EU asylum *acquis* was adopted in June 2013 and is a second generation packet of modified legislation consisting of five legal instruments regulating the EU's international protection procedures: Qualification Directive (Directive 2011/95/EU), the Dublin III Regulation (Regulation (EU) No 604/2013), the Reception Conditions Directive (Directive 2013/33/EU), the Asylum Procedure Directive (Directive 2013/32/EU) and the

Moreover, the EU Directive<sup>36</sup> obligates Member States to ensure that “a person is provided with assistance and support as soon as the competent authorities have a reasonable-grounds indication for believing that the person might have been subjected to trafficking.”<sup>37</sup>

Today, 50% of Member States, including Finland, have implemented measures to proactively detect and identify vulnerable persons seeking international protection at entry borders and reception facilities.<sup>38</sup> Finland asylum authorities proactively screen all applicants to detect presumed and potential victims of human trafficking.<sup>39</sup> In this regard, the Finnish authorities have issued instructions to its frontline professionals (e.g., border guards, immigration, and police) concerning how to identify trafficking victims, how to coordinate services with other state and non-state partners and how to effectively communicate with unaccompanied minors seeking asylum.<sup>40</sup>

Victims detected will be admitted into one of the two specialised facilities for trafficked persons in Finland.<sup>41</sup> The Joutseno Reception Centre admits adult victims of trafficking, while the Oulu Reception Centre admits unaccompanied minors who are child victims of trafficking. Both facilities also serve as reception centres for asylum-seekers. A multidisciplinary evaluation team, led by the director of each centre, is responsible for the identification and admission of each presumed trafficking victim.<sup>42</sup>

The freedom of movement of asylum-seekers, including unaccompanied minors, residing at the centres is not restricted. However, if an unaccompanied minor requires a more restricted location with better security, the unaccompanied minor can be transferred to a child-care institution for security reasons.

While Finland is considered to have established a comprehensive assistance system for asylum-seekers, concerns remain about the potential risk for exploitation faced by asylum seekers in Finland.<sup>43</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

Finland’s **HAPKE II** project increased the level of awareness and expertise among frontline professionals and other actors working closely with asylum-seekers including unaccompanied

---

Eurodac Regulation (Regulation (EU) No 603/2013). See European Commission, *Asylum proposals: a More Protective and Effective Common European Asylum System (CEAS)*, 2011.

<sup>36</sup> Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, April 2011.

<sup>37</sup> European Parliament and Council of the European Union, Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and Protecting its Victims, replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, April 2011.

<sup>38</sup> European Migration Network Study, *Identification of victims of trafficking in human beings in international protection and forced return procedures*, 2014.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid.

<sup>41</sup> Finland’s Act on the Reception of Persons applying for International Protection (746/2011)

<sup>42</sup> The National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland “commended the reception centres and multidisciplinary evaluation teams for their doing pioneering work in the field of assisting victims of human trafficking.” See, Ombudsman of Minorities, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland*, Report 2014, pp 23.

<sup>43</sup> For instance, potential risk for exploitation resulting from informal work arrangements conducted by asylum-seekers while awaiting the regularization of their legal status in Finland. See, Ombudsman of Minorities, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings in Finland*, Report 2014.

minors in Finland.<sup>44</sup> HAPKE involved training on how to better detect trafficking victims and provide competent assistance and support following the victim identification process. The one-year project (2013-2014) was funded by the EU<sup>45</sup> and implemented by the Joutseno and Oulo Centres, in partnership with the Finnish Immigration Service, Regional State Administration Agency and Ombudsman for Minorities.<sup>46</sup>

The project's targeted audience was the Finnish Immigration Service staff and its 19 reception centres, case workers, reception staff and frontline professionals including border guards, asylum and immigration officials.<sup>47</sup> Staff and officials were trained on how to use indicators to identify trafficking victims and persons at-risk of being trafficked.<sup>48</sup> Training topics also included communication methods, relationship-building and victim counselling. Awareness was raised within the asylum-seeker community in order to encourage reporting.

The HAPKE training activities were participatory and inclusive. Staff and volunteers working in the reception centres were involved in the development of the project and were active participants in project activities.<sup>49</sup> Information gathered from focus group discussions with asylum-seekers and trafficking victims fed into the development of materials for asylum-seekers.<sup>50</sup> Once produced, the informational materials were then tested and further developed with the help of the focus group members.<sup>51</sup> Published materials were available in the various relevant foreign languages.<sup>52</sup>

Finland's national anti-trafficking website was improved in collaboration with a multiagency group of experts.<sup>53</sup> The website targets the asylum-seeker community, organisations working with the migrant communities and the general public.<sup>54</sup> Information on the website was made available in simple Finnish and Swedish.<sup>55</sup>

The project also produced a quality-management handbook containing information about the legislation, regulation and policies in Finland in relation to human trafficking and migration.

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ The early identification of trafficking victims among asylum-seekers in Finland is still a challenge, despite the country's proactive screening of asylum applicants.
- ✓ Support for trafficked persons in Finland is available through its National Victim Assistance System operated by the national authorities, trafficker persons may find seeking support from the authorities intimidating.

---

<sup>44</sup> The project's formal name is translated into "The development project for the vulnerable asylum seekers' service provision system in Finland II (HAPKE II)". See, European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Finland, 2014. See also, [www.eucpn.org](http://www.eucpn.org), and [www.ihmiskauppa.fi](http://www.ihmiskauppa.fi)

<sup>45</sup> European Refugee Fund

<sup>46</sup> Ibid.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>48</sup> Ibid.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid. HAPKE project website: [www.ihmiskauppa.fi](http://www.ihmiskauppa.fi)

<sup>54</sup> Ibid.

<sup>55</sup> Ibid.

- ✓ The frequency by which unaccompanied minors abscond from reception centres and become at-risk of being trafficked or re-trafficked is a major challenge for the Finnish authorities.
- ✓ The 12 months timeframe of the project was considered to be too short and caused concern among the 19 reception centres responsible for the implementation of project activities

### Promising Practices

- Training of frontline professionals, such as case workers, reception staff, police, border guards, asylum and immigration officials, resulted in their improved ability to screen for suspected victims of trafficking among applicants undergoing international protection procedures.
- Engagement of a multidisciplinary state and non-state group of project partners extended the project's reach and improved the quality and quantity of activities implemented.
- Sustainability of project activities implemented at the reception centres were achieved through mainstreaming these activities into the daily operations of each reception centre.
- Measures for the evaluation of the project were included: internal qualitative and quantitative goals, self-assessments, participant evaluations, partner feedback and structured timeframes. Evaluation findings and recommendations were shared with project partners, including the managers of the 19 reception centres involved.

## 4.3 FRANCE STRENGTHENS NATIONAL NETWORK FOR THE PROTECTION AND SAFE ACCOMMODATION OF TRAFFICKED PERSONS

### *Background*

The French government estimates that a high percentage of the foreigners among the estimated 20,000 persons involved in prostitution in France are likely victims of human trafficking.<sup>56</sup>

France is primarily a destination and transit country, but also a source country for children, women and men trafficked for sexual and labour exploitation, including forced begging, forced criminality and domestic servitude.<sup>57</sup> Labour exploitation is commonly practiced within the construction, textile, catering, and domestic work sectors, among others.<sup>58</sup> Physical force, coercion and debt bondage as a means of control is common among trafficking cases identified.<sup>59</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by France*, 2013. See also, Heburn, S. and Simon R., *Human Trafficking Around the World: Hidden in Plain Sight*, Columbia University Press, 2013. See generally, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: France*, 2014; and European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>57</sup> GRETA Report, *Ibid.*

<sup>58</sup> Heburn, S and Simon R., *Human Trafficking Around the World: Hidden in Plain Sight*, Columbia University Press, 2013.

<sup>59</sup> *Idid.* Traffickers exploiting women and children from Nigeria use the invocation of voodoo to control their victims.

EU nationals who are victims of trafficking in France are generally nationals of Albania, Bulgaria, Hungary, Moldova, Poland and Romania.<sup>60</sup> Third country nationals trafficked in France are generally from Africa (West and North Africa), Asia (Indonesia, China, and Philippines), Brazil and the Caribbean.<sup>61</sup>

Persons internally trafficked in France, report being recruited at a very young age.<sup>62</sup> Reports further indicate that groups at-risk to being trafficked in France include ethnic-Roma persons, unaccompanied minors, asylum-seekers, impoverished foreign students and domestic workers in diplomatic homes.<sup>63</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

The **AcSé National Network for the Assistance and Protection of Human Trafficking Victims** is a coalition of 70 different shelters and non-government organisations in France specialising on issues of human trafficking.<sup>64</sup> The AcSé network provides support irrespective of gender, and is non-conditional, meaning there is no prerequisite to cooperate with the authorities. Interestingly, a significant percentage of trafficking victims assisted by the AcSé network, later choose to cooperate with the criminal justice system.<sup>65</sup>

AcSé began its operations in 2001<sup>66</sup> and is implemented by the France Association ALC, in partnership with the France's Ministry for Women's Rights, the Ministry of Justice and the Municipality of Paris.<sup>67</sup> The AcSé network is one of the cooperating partners included in the French National Action Plan against Human Trafficking 2014-2016.<sup>68</sup>

The AcSé network is victim-focused, providing protection and assistance to trafficking persons in the form of emergency accommodation, with the possibility to safely relocate elsewhere within France.<sup>69</sup> On average, the AcSé provides assistance to at least one victim per week.<sup>70</sup> As part of its case management system, AcSé conducts an individual case analysis for each person assisted by its network of shelters.<sup>71</sup>

In addition to the network of specialized shelter providers, the AcSé project manages a resource centre for use by frontline professionals where information and advice on human trafficking related issues is easily available.<sup>72</sup> Workshops are organised targeting professionals involved in the criminal justice field on common issues facing AcSé partners:

---

<sup>60</sup> See supra note 1

<sup>61</sup> See supra note 1

<sup>62</sup> See supra note 3

<sup>63</sup> See generally, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: France*, 2014; and also, Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by France*, 2013.

<sup>64</sup> European Crime Prevention Network, Best Practice Conference (ECPN), December 2014. See also, [http://www.acse-alc.org/images/brochure\\_anglais2012.pdf](http://www.acse-alc.org/images/brochure_anglais2012.pdf)

<sup>65</sup> In 2013, 54% of victims assisted by AcSé chose to cooperate with the police, and 30% of the victims chose to participate in legal proceedings against their trafficker. See, European Crime Prevention Award Country Application for France, 2014. pp3.

<sup>66</sup> Unlike the other projects reviewed for this report, AcSé has been operational longer than the average 2 or 3 years.

<sup>67</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for France, 2014.

<sup>68</sup> Ibid.

<sup>69</sup> Ibid.

<sup>70</sup> Ibid.

<sup>71</sup> Ibid.

<sup>72</sup> Ibid.

social workers, law enforcement officers and criminal justice professional members of the justice department.<sup>73</sup>

Through their partnership with the Exit-MTV Foundation, the AcSé project raised awareness about trafficking in human beings.<sup>74</sup>

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Professionals working closely with trafficking victims also require administrative, legal and social services support in order to maintain healthy and focused. Otherwise the professional competency at the organisation drops and the organisation may find itself with a high turn-over rate among its professional staff.
- ✓ An efficient case management system is a critical and integral part of the project because a victim-centered approach requires that each individual case be assessed and the offered assistance to be customised accordingly.
- ✓ The logistical and administrative support linked to the protection of trafficked persons participating in the AcSé project can often be difficult and cumbersome, e.g., emergency shelter apartments, financial assistance, travel documents, transport costs and arrangements.

### Promising Practices

- Assistance and emergency support should be also accessible to presumed victims and vulnerable persons seeking to escape an at-risk environment.
- Partnering with government at the political level allows for the project's work and results to be conveyed to the government systematically and thus impact the formulation of policy and legislation against human trafficking at the national level.
- Conducting both internal and external project evaluation processes to identify the longer-term impact of the project.
- Establishment of a forum where project results and lessons learned can be periodically shared with stakeholders.

## 4.4 IRELAND PROTECTS THE RIGHTS OF MIGRANT WORKERS VICTIMS OF LABOUR EXPLOITATION

### Background

Ireland is predominately a country of destination, and to some extent a country of origin and transit, for the sexual and labour exploitation of women, children and men.<sup>75</sup> Trafficking for labour exploitation is most common in agriculture, cannabis cultivation, domestic service, restaurant and catering sectors.<sup>76</sup> Asylum seekers, unaccompanied minors and Irish nationals including children are among the identified victims of trafficking in Ireland.<sup>77</sup> Trafficked persons identified in Ireland originate primarily from Africa (mainly Nigeria), Asia (China, Vietnam), European Union and Latin America.<sup>78</sup> <sup>79</sup>

<sup>73</sup> Ibid.

<sup>74</sup> Ibid.

<sup>75</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Ireland*, 2013.

<sup>76</sup> Ibid. See also U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Ireland*, 2014.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid. See also, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Ireland*, 2014.

<sup>78</sup> Ibid. See also, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Ireland*, 2014.

<sup>79</sup> Interestingly, there have been reports indicating that Irish nationals have also been trafficked transnationally for labour and sexual exploitation. According to Irish civil society organization Cois Tine: "...In 2012 the same

Complicating matters, with regards to understanding the trafficking situation in Ireland, is the fact that Ireland has both a large scale emigration and fluid immigration.<sup>80</sup> In recent years, due to the economic crisis, Ireland has again experienced the emigration of Irish nationals, increase of women entering the labour force, and the return (and onward migration) of former migrant workers in Ireland. This influx of persons, often financially deprived, moving in and out of the country provide traffickers with a pool of potential victims of human trafficking. Identifying trafficking victims, particularly among migrant workers, remains a challenge for the Irish authorities: "...identification of suspected victims remains one of the most difficult problems ...not only because traffickers seek to avoid detection, but also because presumed victims, for numerous reasons, often go to great lengths to hide their experience from state authorities."<sup>81</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

**Migrant Rights Centre Ireland (MRCI)** is a national non-governmental advocacy organisation working to identify, assist and protect victims of human trafficking for labour exploitation in Ireland.<sup>82</sup> Through its various initiatives MRCI aims to promote justice, empowerment and equality for the migrant community in Ireland. MRCI's partners include trade unions, national, international and faith-based organisations.<sup>83</sup>

MRCI, established in 2001, began as a grassroots forum where migrant workers could meet to exchange experiences, and receive support and information about their legal rights as migrant workers in Ireland. MRCI began its efforts to tackle forced labour and exploitation with a 2004 study on violence against migrants working as domestic workers in private homes in Ireland.<sup>84</sup> The follow-up to the national study was the establishment of three advocacy groups comprised of migrant workers: Restaurant Workers Action Group, Agricultural Workers Association and the Domestic Workers Action Group.<sup>85</sup>

---

report said Ireland is a destination, source, and transit country for women, men, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labor. It's not just a matter of people being trafficked into Ireland. Irish people have been trafficked (documented evidence of Irish people being trafficked for labour in Australia and for prostitution in the Netherlands exists) and also people have been trafficked through Ireland to other countries..."

<http://www.coistine.ie/home/364-trafficking> See also, The Netherland's National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, *Human Trafficking – Ten Years of Independent Monitoring*, 2010, pp 64 and 162.

<sup>80</sup> Ireland, along with Sweden and the UK offered nationals from the EU's new-member states access to their labour markets immediately following the enlargement of the EU in May 2004.

<sup>81</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Ireland*, 2013, pp10.

<sup>82</sup> Migrant Rights Centre Ireland, <http://www.mrci.ie/>

<sup>83</sup> MRCI has worked with lobbying organisations like the International Labour Organisation and has joined forces with national organisations in Ireland in a call for action to mobilise support for the ILO Convention for Decent Work and Rights for Domestic Workers. McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, p 10.

<sup>84</sup> The MRCI Domestic Workers Action Group was tasked with addressing the exploitation and unfair treatment of migrant domestic workers, mostly foreign women working in private homes as au-pair, child-care providers, cleaners and care-takers. When legal admission into Ireland for migrant domestic workers came to a close on the eve of economic crisis in 2007, MRCI noticed a suspicious increase in the level of recruitment of "au pairs" via ads on websites and newspapers offering au pairs of non-EU nationality work in Ireland, full-time or part-time, from three months to two years. McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, pp7-12.

<sup>85</sup> McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013.

The organisation has its own quarterly membership newsletter and is active on social media, including a Facebook profile. On its website, MRCI posts information explaining the employment rights of migrant workers in Ireland and how to enforce those rights, including information on the national Labour Inspectorate and the Rights Commissioner Service<sup>86</sup>.

MRCI uses a rigorous assessment to identify presumed victims who approach MRCI seeking assistance, some of whom are in a vulnerable situation due to their undocumented status in the country, and others are detected as victims of forced labour.<sup>87</sup> Trafficked persons who accept to pursue a legal claim are then provided with support and referrals to partner organizations.<sup>88</sup>

In cases against foreign diplomats involved in human trafficking for forced labour, MRCI publically campaigned against the use of diplomatic immunity as a legal defence. At least three such cases involving employers who were foreign diplomats based in Ireland were considered sufficiently serious to be referred to the national anti-human trafficking unit for investigation.<sup>89</sup> These cases demonstrating the reality of forced labour and exploitation in Ireland gained national media attention, making an impact on the country's ongoing public debate with regards to the plight of victims of human trafficking in Ireland.<sup>90</sup>

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Utilize the media to maintain the issue on the public agenda and influence public opinion.
- ✓ Reach out to trade unions, faith-based organizations and professional associations.
- ✓ High-level political will at the national and international level is necessary when dealing with perpetrators attempting to hide behind diplomatic immunity.

### Promising Practices

- Empowerment of exploited workers who actively participate and act to claim their human rights. MRCI listens to the experiences of its target group and engages their participation against the exploitation experienced through jointly developed initiatives.
- MRCI's focused attention on assisting and protecting victims of domestic servitude, and working towards the prevention of exploitative labour practices by foreign diplomats and international personnel based in Ireland.

---

<sup>86</sup> Labour Relations Commission, the statutory body that provides conciliation services in industrial relations in Ireland.

<sup>87</sup> MRCI uses the Delphi Methodology. See International Labour Organization (ILO), *Operational Indicators of Trafficking in Human Beings*, May 2009. <http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm> See also, McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013.

<sup>88</sup> McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, pp6.

<sup>89</sup> See supra note 60, pp7.

<sup>90</sup> Ibid. One example of a high profile case was that of a Ukrainian woman employed as a domestic worker in the private home of a South African embassy diplomat. The domestic worker in this case did not have a contract and her conditions of employment were considered to be exploitative. MRCI picketed outside the embassy and outside the private house of the embassy staff member who was the employer. A number of claims were lodged with the relevant state authorities but all were all initially dismissed following the employer's claim of diplomatic immunity.

- Tackling labour exploitation through awareness-raising campaigns, creating national and international partnerships, promoting legislative reform<sup>91</sup> and paying special attention to the gender dimension of human trafficking.

#### 4.5 POLAND TACKLES HUMAN TRAFFICKING AMONG THE RESIDENTS OF BORDER AND TOURIST COMMUNITIES

##### *Background*

Poland is a sending country of labour migrants to the EU and thus primarily recognized as a country of origin for trafficking in human beings.<sup>92</sup> Sexual exploitation makes up about 80% of the trafficking cases in Poland, followed closely by cases of labour exploitation, including domestic servitude.<sup>93</sup> The UK and Sweden are the most common destination countries for persons trafficked transnationally from Poland.<sup>94</sup>

Due to its growing economy and strategic geographical location, Poland has increasingly become a country of destination for Central and Eastern Europeans and third country nationals from Asia seeking entry into Europe. Third-country nationals who are victims of labour exploitation in Poland originate from Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Belarus, China, Nepal, Philippines, Ukraine, Vietnam, among others.<sup>95</sup> Victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation identified in Poland tend to be from Belarus, Bulgaria, Moldova, Romania, and Ukraine.<sup>96</sup> Roma children are subjected to forced begging in Poland.<sup>97</sup>

Polish nationals also constitute a significant percentage of trafficked persons identified in Poland and within the EU. Polish migrant workers are present in several EU countries, among which are possible cases of human trafficking. It is estimated that the highest number of Polish migrant workers are in the UK working within the agriculture, construction, domestic care service and transport industries.<sup>98</sup>

Other sectors within the EU where migrant workers are in demand, and where forced labour and labour exploitation cases have been detected include construction forestry, horticulture, shellfish gathering, handicraft sweatshops, food processing and packaging.<sup>99</sup> Seasonal and

<sup>91</sup> For example, Ireland's Employment Permits Act 2006 Section 23 criminalising excessive control over workers. The Permit Act "makes it an offence for employers to retain workers' passports, identity papers, qualification documents, driving licenses or to make deductions from their wages to pay recruitment fees, travelling expenses or other fees related to obtaining a job in Ireland." McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, pp10.

<sup>92</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Poland*, 2013. See generally, European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>93</sup> Ibid. See generally, TRACE, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014.

<sup>94</sup> Ibid.

<sup>95</sup> Ibid.

<sup>96</sup> Ibid.

<sup>97</sup> Ibid. See also, Tamas, Adelina, Predut, Claudia and Medvichi, Nadia, *Trafficking in Persons for begging, Romania Study*, Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), Swiss-Romanian Cooperation Program, 2013.

<sup>98</sup> OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, *Analysing the Business Model of Trafficking in Human Beings to Better Prevent the Crime*, 2010, pp 9.

<sup>99</sup> Perocco, Fabio, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Italy*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, pp 3.

temporary work, such as crop harvesting and construction, at particular times of the year can generate among receiving countries a demand for cheap labour, and some of these migrants may have been trafficked into force labour or may eventually become trafficked victims.

Poland's Western Pomerania is a region known for its migratory outflow and transit of persons on route to Western Europe and the Nordic countries. It is a coastal and border region in northwest Poland where human trafficking, is an issue of concern to the government. Traffickers transit their victims through the Szczecin region and also recruit victims while in the region, primarily for the purpose of sexual and labour exploitation.

Raising awareness about the recruitment phase of human trafficking in countries of origin, as in the case of Poland, can be effective in disrupting human trafficking.<sup>100</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

In an effort to help prevent its residents from being recruited into human trafficking and to raise public awareness levels about trafficking in the region, the Western Pomerania Provincial Office and its Szczecin Province Police Department implemented a three -year project (2008-2010) called, ***Not Every Train Goes to Hollywood***.<sup>101</sup>

The campaign *Not Every Train goes to Hollywood* was a joint initiative and the title alluded to a popular Polish film "Train to Hollywood" telling the story of a young girl dreaming to become an actress.<sup>102</sup> The campaign warned about unrealistic expectations regarding work abroad, which can then be used by recruiters to lure potential victims into human trafficking.<sup>103</sup> It addressed the recruitment phase of human trafficking in a manner that engaged the attention of youths and young adults, persons more apt to take risks when seeking new opportunities, either nationally or transnationally.<sup>104</sup>

A survey conducted as part of the project showed that a high percentage of respondents were unaware of the various forms of recruitment methods used by traffickers.<sup>105</sup> Young persons interviewed were under the mistaken impression that traffickers mainly used physical violence to control their victims, or that being trafficked involved being kidnapped.<sup>106</sup> The

---

<sup>100</sup> OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, *Analysing the Business Model of Trafficking in Human Beings to Better Prevent the Crime*, 2010, P 48.

<sup>101</sup> The project was Poland's submission to the 2014 European Crime Prevention Best Practice Conference where a total of 20 EU national projects were entered into the annual award competition. See, European Crime Prevention Network, Best Practice Conference (ECPN), December 2014. <http://eucpn.org>  
See also, Szczecin Province Police Department. <http://www.szczecin.kwp.gov.pl/profilaktyka>

<sup>102</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014.

<sup>103</sup> The project partnered with other local government entities, as well as two civil society organizations: West Pomeranian Provincial Office, Szczecin Province Police, Western Pomerania Board of Education, Ministry of Home Affairs Department of Migration Policy, Foundation Safer Together, NGO ITAKA, representatives from the West Pomeranian Province border control, media and university. The project was financed by the West Pomeranian Provincial Office and of Ministry of Home Affairs Department of Migration Policy. Kloc-Nowak, Weronika, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Poland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013, p 19.

<sup>104</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014.

<sup>105</sup> Over 80% out of the 500 participants surveyed as part of the project. 62% incorrectly interpreted the forms of trafficking and another 28% referred to trafficking as a "historical phenomenon". See, European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014, pp7&9.

<sup>106</sup> Ibid. Respondents often referenced the violence and kidnapping depicted in popular fiction films.

majority surveyed were unaware as to how and to what extent new technology was a significant tool in the recruitment process of potential victims.<sup>107</sup>

Interestingly, survey respondents expressed that the human trafficking problem did not apply to Polish society, and that the potential risk of being trafficked existed less in Poland, than in other countries.<sup>108</sup> In other words, a number of young people from the Polish province of Western Pomerania were not making the connection between the choices they made and risks taken, in terms of falling victim to human trafficking.

The project *Not Every Train goes to Hollywood* focused on increasing the level of knowledge and awareness about human trafficking among teachers, teaching staff, school management, students and parents in Western Pomerania.<sup>109</sup> Participating government and non-governmental partner organisations met and discussed human trafficking with young people, teachers, social workers and civil society organizations.<sup>110</sup> The project also addressed the demand side by organising public exhibitions targeting regions frequented by tourists, such as seaside resorts.

Project activities<sup>111</sup> included the production of an anti-trafficking film by and about secondary school students. Internet activities and social media were key components in the awareness-raising campaign.<sup>112</sup> The project organised a series of trainings involving over 400 persons, including a forum for the exchange of experiences between law enforcement from Poland and neighbouring Ukraine and Belarus, both primarily countries of origin but also transit.<sup>113</sup>

The project educated young people of Western Pomerania on how to become responsible about personal security and how to better assess risks when seeking opportunities, including when traveling abroad.<sup>114</sup> The project disseminated leaflets and posters in Szczecin and neighbouring towns, particularly towns closest to coastal tourist resorts.<sup>115</sup> The printed material distributed presented some of the basic recruitment strategies used by traffickers today, and provided advice and a checklist for traveling abroad.<sup>116</sup> Examples of items on the

---

<sup>107</sup> The survey revealed that, in general, youths were spending more time and energy choosing a mobile phone than doing the follow-up work necessary to confirm the legitimacy of a potential employer or language school outside Poland. See, European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014.

<sup>108</sup> Ibid. Out of a surveyed population of about 500 persons aged 16-19 years, 75% strongly felt that the problem of trafficking in human beings does not apply to Poland and that such cases occur in situation of armed conflicts or in developed countries.

<sup>109</sup> Ibid. Specifically, directors, principals, secondary school teachers, tutors, parents and youths aged 16-19 yrs.

<sup>110</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014.

<sup>111</sup> Awareness raising campaign against trafficking in human beings, primarily aimed at Poles considering work abroad. Available: <http://www.szczecin.kwp.gov.pl/hollywood/index.html>

<sup>112</sup> A study conducted in 2014 on trafficking for labour exploitation in Poland assessed electronic media and online forums used by job-seekers in Poland looking for employment abroad. Such forums enabled jobseekers to make informed decision about migrating abroad for work due to the availability of online research and discussions with peers, trade unions, and support groups. See, Lasocik, Zbigniew, Rekosz-Cebula, Emilia & Wiczorek, Lukasz, *Trafficking in Human Beings for Labour Exploitation in Poland: Legal Regulations, Trends and Countermeasures*, CBSS Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2014. Cited in Sorrentino, Liliana and Anniina Jokinen *Guidelines to prevent abusive recruitment, exploitative employment and trafficking of migrant workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), Publication Series No. 78, pp 67-68.

<sup>113</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Poland, 2014.

<sup>114</sup> Ibid.

<sup>115</sup> Ibid.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

checklist included, securing copies of personal documents, taking contact phone numbers, verifying a job offer and/or the credibility of the recruitment agency.<sup>117</sup>

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Based on the survey results, the organisers realised there would have been a benefit in expanding its public education campaign to reflect additional forms of human trafficking. Each form of recognized exploitation comes with its own set of actors, facilitators, victims, recruiting tactics and exploitation methods. Expanding the campaign to include this additional information would have required additional time and resources.
- ✓ Exploitation of victims involving benefit fraud appears to be a rising trend in Poland.
- ✓ How to address the socio-economic push factors in the Polish context which are motivating youths and young adults to subject themselves to the risk of exploitation.

### Promising Practices

- The project's use of social media channels and multimedia art exhibitions allowed for both a visual and interactive experience to educate the target group, and to creatively convey the project's message to the public.
- Giving the geographic location where the project was implemented, focus was placed on communities in border towns, seaside resorts and tourist areas through digital and mainstream media, including surveys targeting residents and resort visitors.
- The campaign's target audience also reached resort management and staff, education administrators (not only teachers and parents), and even representatives from language schools (who may inadvertently facilitate the trafficking recruitment process by giving dubious persons/agencies access to communicate with their students).
- Build the capacity of key stakeholders, specifically parents, legal guardians, education administrators, language schools and universities, to better understand recruiting methods for trafficking and risk factors linked to increased vulnerability of students and young persons.

## 4.6 ROMANIA RAISES AWARENESS AMONG YOUTH THROUGH CREATIVITY AND SPORTS

### *Background*

Romania is a source, transit and destination country for human trafficking in all its forms, but primarily for sexual and labour exploitation, including begging and criminal activity.<sup>118</sup> Romanian nationals, particularly women and girls, comprise a significant percentage of trafficking victims in Romania recruited into forced begging or forced prostitution through acquaintances in Romania.<sup>119</sup> The number of foreign nationals trafficked in Romania are generally low. Vulnerable persons, such as ethnic Roma persons, the disabled, elderly, children and youths, are more likely to be trafficked domestically and transnationally.<sup>120</sup> Nearly 50% of trafficking victims of labour exploitation identified in Romania are ethnic

<sup>117</sup> Ibid.

<sup>118</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Romania*, 2012. See also, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Romania*, 2014; and European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

<sup>119</sup> Ibid. See generally, TRACE, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014; and TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

<sup>120</sup> European Roma Rights Centre, *Breaking the Silence Report*, 2011.

Roma.<sup>121</sup>

There is a relatively high re-trafficking rate for trafficked persons who are nationals of Romania.<sup>122</sup> Reasons may vary but the most common reason for re-victimization appears to be the scarcity and poor quality of reintegration support and social services available to repatriated victims of trafficking.<sup>123</sup>

In Romania, public awareness levels continue to be relatively low regarding the various and evolving forms of human trafficking, such as forced begging.<sup>124</sup> The implementation of local, regional and national public education campaigns remains critical to the Romania's anti-trafficking prevention efforts.

### ***Project Summary***

One such national awareness campaign was the private-public project titled the “***No Project***” which focused on raising the awareness of teens (14 -18 yrs.) and young persons (18 -30 yrs.) about human trafficking and the behavioural risks associated with becoming a potential trafficking victim.<sup>125</sup> The project was implemented by four Romanian partners: National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP)<sup>126</sup>, two civil society organisations ADPARE (Association for Development Alternatives Practices for Reintegration and Education), eLiberare, and a private commercial bank, Bancpost.

The theme “use your talent against human trafficking” was divided into two distinct sectors, visual arts and sports, under which several interactive project activities were implemented.<sup>127</sup> Young people were invited to interact among each other and express themselves through art, music, dance, drama, film and social media.<sup>128</sup> During these organised project activities, the youth and young adults received information about human trafficking and the circumstances in which young people often find themselves that may increase their risk of falling into an exploitative situation.<sup>129</sup>

---

<sup>121</sup> Sixty-eight percent of the Romani trafficked persons interviewed in this study had been trafficked to another European Union (EU) country, while 32% had been trafficked to another location within their own country. See, European Roma Rights Centre, *Breaking the Silence Report*, 2011.

<sup>122</sup> Tamas, Adelina, Predut, Claudia and Medvichi, Nadia, *Trafficking in Persons for begging, Romania Study*, Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), Swiss Romanian Cooperation Program, 2013.

<sup>123</sup> Ibid.

<sup>124</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Romania*, 2012. See also, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Romania*, 2014; European Roma Rights Centre, *Breaking the Silence Report*, 2011.

<sup>125</sup> Romania's efforts at tackling human trafficking were recognized by the EU during the European Crime Prevention Best Practice Conference held December 2014 in Italy where ‘No Project’ was awarded second place, out of a total of 20 EU Member State projects in the competition. Project website, <http://www.thenoproject.ro/expozitie/>

<sup>126</sup> ANITP is Romania's national anti-trafficking policy-making entity. ANITP designed and financed the project at a total cost of EUR 50,000. The project produced 28,000 flyers ;1,000 data collection cards; 500 posters; 5,000 stickers; 700 bags; 1,000 folders; 1,000 notebooks; 2 large fully branded tents; 22 banners; 6 flags; and 3,500 T-shirts. The project began in 2013 and remains operational. See, European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Romania, 2014. <http://eucpn.org>

<sup>127</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Romania, 2014.

<sup>128</sup> Ibid.

<sup>129</sup> Ibid.

The project's first component, Art4Freedom, was implemented in collaboration with two local universities and 11 art schools in Romania. Activities involved multimedia art seminars consisting of documentaries, animation, music, art and dance thereby offering the participating youth a comfortable and familiar platform whereby they could express and share creatively their thoughts and fears with regards to human trafficking.<sup>130</sup> In addition, Art4Freedom hosted, a public portrait session involving over 100 portrait artists, and an online exhibition consisting of over 100 pieces of artwork belonging to students from seven Romanian cities.<sup>131</sup>

The project's Run4Freedom consisted of a relay race with over 400 participants and a two-day hip-hop dance competition attracting over 900 participants.<sup>132</sup> Employees of Bancpost, the project's private sector partner and donor, also joined Run4Freedom by wearing the project's logo shirt and thus publically promoting the anti-trafficking message while running in national and international events.<sup>133</sup>

Given the high prevalence of internet users among Romanian youth and children, the project included a strong online component to its communication strategy in order to successfully roll-out its campaign and reach its targeted group.<sup>134</sup> The "No Project" utilized both online (website, social media, bloggers) and off-line (a variety of informational materials produced and disseminated) tools to reach its desired target group. The campaign's use of social media tools Facebook, twitter and the project website to convey its message resulted in a total of 800,000 online visitors.<sup>135</sup>

Mainstream media was also used to keep the project's anti-trafficking message high on the public agenda, which resulted in 40 news articles, 3 television features and 33 blog posts.<sup>136</sup> In addition, the project received over 8000 in-person visitors at the NO Project information tent, which was opened 12 hours per day for 8 days in the centre of Bucharest. Overall, project activities were estimated to have reached over 2 million persons in Romania.<sup>137</sup>

Noteworthy is the fact that beyond the *No Project* campaign, the Government of Romania has been and remains active in implementing preventive activities such as local, regional, national and transnational public education initiatives. Romania's National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), implemented approximately 91 public education initiatives between the 2012 and 2013.<sup>138</sup> These initiatives consisted of 79 regional and/or local, and 12 national campaigns aimed at raising awareness among targeted vulnerable groups in Romania.<sup>139</sup>

---

<sup>130</sup> Ibid.

<sup>131</sup> Ibid.

<sup>132</sup> Ibid.

<sup>133</sup> Ibid.

<sup>134</sup> In a survey involving 903 secondary school students in Romania, 87% responded that the internet plays an important to very important role in their lives; 64% used it to primarily play online games whereas 86% used it to primarily communicate and engage in social media. Romanian Crime Research and Prevention Institute, *Strengthening the Capacity of Romanian Law Enforcement Agencies to Prevent and Investigate Internet Child Pornography Cases*, Romania and Norway Police Departments, 2010.

<sup>135</sup> Ibid.

<sup>136</sup> Ibid.

<sup>137</sup> Ibid.

<sup>138</sup> National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), *Report submitted by the Romanian Authorities on measures taken to comply with Committee of the Parties Recommendation CP (2012)7 on the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014, pp13, 2014.

<sup>139</sup> Ibid.

ANITP estimated that over 1,000,000 persons were reached through the awareness raising campaign.<sup>140</sup> Online viewers registered totalled at 2,500,000 persons.<sup>141</sup>

### Lesson Learned

- ✓ Smooth implementation and national coverage of the project was made possible through the coordinated efforts of the 15 regional centres operating under ANITP, the project partner leader: “Constant and regular communication and coordination between the stakeholders and project team ensured timely identification of possible threats and allowed finding the most appropriate ways to overcome the obstacles.”<sup>142</sup>
- ✓ It remains uncertain whether and to what extent the awareness-raising activities reached the ethnic-Roma community in Romania.

### Promising Practices

- Behavioural change among the youth tends to take place through peer-to-peer interaction in which the desired change in behaviour is promoted and encouraged.
- Engaging the private sector in the fight against human trafficking. The involvement of public-private partnerships in the development and implementation of anti-trafficking initiatives serves to expand the number and type of stakeholders engaged in combatting human trafficking. Moreover, private-public endeavours tend to strengthen the partnership because financial support for the initiative tends to be generous and easier to access.<sup>143</sup>
- Inviting the target group to learn in a non-conventional way, allowing the new message to be channelled through the use of non-traditional mediums: “More likely to create interest among this segment of the population... “[they] are not passive actors... they can do something and they can do it following their passion.”<sup>144</sup>
- National awareness campaign initiatives targeting youth and young adults require an online and social media component incorporated into the campaign strategy.

## 4.7 SWEDEN EMBRACES A VICTIM-CENTRED APPROACH TO INTERAGENCY COOPERATION AND COORDINATION

### Background

Sweden is a transit and destination country for trafficking in human beings.<sup>145</sup> Trafficking victims identified in Sweden are mainly woman and girls from Central and Eastern Europe, former Soviet Union, as well as Nigeria and Thailand among others.<sup>146</sup>

<sup>140</sup> Ibid.

<sup>141</sup> Public education initiatives implemented in cooperation with the Government of Romania and transnational in nature have in recent times focused on the prevention of trafficking in persons for labour exploitation. One such campaign, *To work is a right! To exploit work is a crime!* was co-sponsored by the EU and involved Hungary, Bulgaria, Greece, Cyprus, Macedonia and Romania. See, National Agency against Trafficking in Persons, *National Report regarding trafficking in persons in 2012*, pp 62, 2012.

<sup>142</sup> European Crime Prevention Award, Country Application for Romania, 2014. pp5.

<sup>143</sup> Romania’s No Project was a private-public partnership between Bancpost and ANITP.

<sup>144</sup> See supra note 25, European Crime Prevention Network pp7.

<sup>145</sup> Council of the Baltic Sea States, *Human Trafficking 2013, Baltic Sea Region Round-up*, 2013. pp.98; See also, TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014; and U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Sweden*, 2014.

<sup>146</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Sweden*, 2014; Council of the Baltic Sea States, *Human Trafficking 2013, Baltic Sea Region Round-up*, 2013; and U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Sweden*, 2014.

General trends indicate that traffickers recruit victims online in the victim's country of origin to be sexually exploited in Sweden.<sup>147</sup> Traffickers post online employment vacancies for various types of jobs, including jobs within the sex industry.<sup>148</sup> Traffickers, both men and woman, usually come from the same country of origin as the victim.<sup>149</sup>

Transporting victims into Sweden by road, ferry or air is the norm.<sup>150</sup> The victims are usually housed for short-term periods in a series of subleased apartments or houses in and around major cities in Sweden.<sup>151</sup> The sexual exploitation of a trafficked person in Sweden can earn a trafficker between 245 EUR and 370 EUR per hour.<sup>152</sup>

Trafficking for forced begging and labour exploitation also exists in Sweden.<sup>153</sup> Persons begging in Sweden are predominately from the ethnic Roma communities originating from Bulgaria and Romania. According to police investigations and anecdotal evidence, a growing number of the Roma beggars in Sweden, for instance the elderly, youth, and persons with disabilities are presumed to be trafficked victims of forced labour.<sup>154</sup> A beggar in Stockholm can collect approximately 22-31 EUR daily by begging on the streets, however most probably the money received through street begging is then handed-over to the organizer either the entire amount or a substantial portion thereof.<sup>155</sup>

The challenge for Sweden is the identification of trafficking victims and the prosecution of traffickers.<sup>156</sup> Law enforcement and legal professionals require access to information regarding the criminal network involved in the exploitation of persons in Sweden. In general, trafficking victims who have received support and protection while in the country of destination are more opened to supporting the criminal justice system by corroborating or providing information to law enforcement and legal professionals.<sup>157</sup>

Currently in Sweden, trafficked persons are identified as victims and then provided with assistance through a process that is unstructured, non-systematic and informal.<sup>158</sup> To progress in this matter, Sweden is working on formalizing national and transnational cooperation between key agencies, state and non-state, involved in the identification, assistance and protection of trafficked persons.

---

<sup>147</sup> Ibid.

<sup>148</sup> Ibid.

<sup>149</sup> TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid.

<sup>151</sup> Ibid.

<sup>152</sup> CBSS TF-THB Interview with Swedish Expert on 9 October 2014; see, TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

<sup>153</sup> Sorrentino, L., Jokinen, A., *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), Council of the Baltic Sea States, 2014

<sup>154</sup> TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

<sup>155</sup> CBSS TF-THB Interview with Swedish Expert on 9 October 2014; see, TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

<sup>156</sup> Ibid.

<sup>157</sup> International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), *Guidelines for the Development of a Transnational Referral Mechanism for Trafficked Persons: South-Eastern Europe*, 2009; also, OSCE, *National Referral Mechanisms: Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons, a Practical Guide*, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, 2004.

<sup>158</sup> Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Sweden*, 2014.

### ***Project Summary***

Sweden's Office of the National Coordinator against Human Trafficking, operating under the auspices of the County Administrative Board of Stockholm, galvanized support for the funding, development and implementation of a transnational referral mechanism.<sup>159</sup> Transnational Referral Mechanism (TRM) is a proven policy and procedural framework for the comprehensive cross-border assistance and support provided to trafficked persons. The establishment of a TRM involves the development five separate standard operating procedures (SOPs) which integrate and formalize the process of victim identification, return and assistance between countries of transit, destination and origin.<sup>160</sup>

In 2014, the County Administrative Board of Stockholm began implementation of the **SE-TRM** project.<sup>161</sup> The long-term objective of the project is to improve the operational coordination between Sweden as the destination country and transnational stakeholders located in the countries of origin and transit, who are involved in the identification, protection and support of trafficking victims.<sup>162</sup>

The first phase of SE-TRM was implemented between May and December 2014. The eight-month initiative was aimed at facilitating a process whereby a number of Swedish state and non-state actors came together to operationalise existing legislative and/or administrative procedures. Efforts resulted in the development of five SOPs for the identification and referral of trafficking victims in Sweden.<sup>163</sup> The SOPs drafted were in line with domestic and EU policies and legal standards regarding the human rights of trafficking victims.<sup>164</sup> The next phase of SE-TRM is envisaged to be implemented in 2015.

Sweden has taken steps towards strengthening its anti-trafficking coordination at the local level, as well. The Office of the National Coordinator against Human Trafficking is working towards building the capacity of local municipalities in Sweden to improve the identification

---

<sup>159</sup> Broaden mandate and function of the County Administrative Board of Stockholm: *"The Swedish authorities recognised the need to broaden the mandate and competences of existing coordinating structures and on 11 April 2013 the Government issued a decision whereby the County Administrative Board of Stockholm was given a mandate to co-ordinate national efforts on combating trafficking for the purpose of removal of organs, military service, forced labour or other activities in a situation that places a person in distress. According to this decision, the County Administrative Board of Stockholm is required to strengthen collaboration with public bodies, local authorities, voluntary organisations and interest groups, as well as other national and international actors, including the Swedish diplomatic missions abroad."* Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Sweden*, 2014, pp22.

<sup>160</sup> ICMPD, CABS Information Sheet, 2014. See also, OSCE, *National Referral Mechanisms: Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons, A Practical Guide*, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, 2004. See generally, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), *Guidelines for the Development of a Transnational Referral Mechanism for Trafficked Persons: South-Eastern Europe*, 2009.

<sup>161</sup> Sweden's Transnational Referral Mechanism (SE-TRM) was funded by the County Administrative Board of Stockholm, in partnership with the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) and a number of state and non-state agencies. Mikamottagningen (Social Services), National Rapporteur on Trafficking, Swedish Prosecution Authority, Swedish Police Authority, National Bureau of Investigation County Coordinators against Prostitution in Sweden (National Task Force against Prostitution), Migration Board, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Health and Social Affairs Civil Society Platform against Trafficking, Talita Safe House, Skogsbo Salvation Army, Unga Kvinnors Värn Shelter, IOM Helsinki. See, ICMPD, CABS Information Sheet, 2014. Details available at <http://www.icmpd.org/Completed-Projects.1677.0.html>

<sup>162</sup> ICMPD email communication with CBSS dated 2 February 2015; see also, County Administrative Board of Stockholm, *2014 Annual Report*, 2014, pp.140 (*available in Swedish as Årsredovisning 2014*).

<sup>163</sup> Ibid. See also, ICMPD, CABS Information Sheet, 2014.

<sup>164</sup> Ibid.

and support to trafficked persons. The twelve months municipality project called **Strengthening the Role of Municipalities (STROM)** is currently being implemented by CBSS TF-THB and involves the Baltic Sea region countries.<sup>165</sup> The STROM project will conduct a baseline assessment; gather best practices and lessons learned from sample municipalities in Denmark, Estonia, Finland, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, Norway, Poland, the Russian Federation and Sweden. A regional expert meeting will be organized and guidelines will be developed as a tool for municipal-level actors to use when providing support to trafficked persons within their municipal boundaries.<sup>166</sup>

Worthy of mentioning is Sweden's continued commitment to the protection of vulnerable children, including unaccompanied minors seeking asylum, who may be at-risk of being trafficked or have been trafficked.<sup>167</sup> For instance, relevant Swedish actors and institutions have been active partners in the regional project **PROTECT Children on the Move**. The project, implemented by the CBSS Expert Group for Cooperation on Children-at-Risk, focuses on strengthening national and transnational child protection systems for children on the move in Europe and particularly in the Baltic Sea Region.<sup>168</sup>

With regards to Sweden's recent initiative to develop a Transnational Referral Mechanism, initial observations include:

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Significant progress has been made in Sweden in tackling human trafficking through capacity building and public education initiatives; however discussions in the course of the SE-TRM project revealed that much still remains to be done in the area of victim identification, support and referral.<sup>169</sup>
- ✓ The project presupposed cooperation between all the partners. Once the SOPs are developed, endorsement of the SOPs from the partners is critical since the purpose of the process and resulting framework is to strengthen coordination within and between agencies involved in the identification and referral system. In this case, the jointly developed SOPs were validated by the project partners.<sup>170</sup>
- ✓ The project activities allowed the organiser, Sweden's Office of the National Coordinator against Human Trafficking, to gauge and address the various commitment levels of its project partners. Often, not all partners are equally committed, reasons may vary and include for example, lack of financial resources or lack of political will. In this case, the SE-TRM project partners displayed full commitment to the overall objectives of the project.<sup>171</sup>

<sup>165</sup> Strengthening the Role of Municipalities (STROM), 2014-2015 is funded by the CBSS and Swedish Institute. Implementation partners: Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Latvia, NGO Living for Tomorrow in Estonia, Association of Local Authorities in Lithuania, Ministry of Justice and Public Security in Norway, Ministry of Interior in Poland, and County Administrative Board of Stockholm. See, CBSS TF-THB, STROM Information Sheet, 2014. See, <http://www.cbss.org/safe-secure-region/tfthb/>

<sup>166</sup> CBSS TF-THB, STROM Information Sheet, 2014.

<sup>167</sup> UNICEF, *Child Trafficking in the Nordic Countries: Rethinking strategies and national responses*, 2011; See also, Council of the Baltic Sea States Expert Group for Cooperation on Children-at-Risk, *Recommendation from the Conference on How to Enhance Assistance to Victims of Human Trafficking in the Baltic Region*, March 2014. Sample projects available herein section 6: PROTECT, CONNECT and *Kampanjen Resekurage*.

<sup>168</sup> See herein section 6, pp 57; details available at <http://www.childcentre.info/>

<sup>169</sup> ICMPD email communication with CBSS dated 2 February 2015.

<sup>170</sup> Ibid.

<sup>171</sup> Ibid.

### Promising Practices

- Development and implementation of a standardised and institutionalised methodology for the identification, assistance and protection of trafficked persons.
- Standard operating procedures are tools which add value to existing anti-trafficking networks because they are meant to build upon and formalise existing mechanisms for coordination and cooperation between state and non-state partner institutions, both domestically and cross-border.
- Increasing the number of identified victims of trafficking by engaging a broadened and diversified group of frontline professionals.
- Expanding local support services to include presumed victims, may further widen the pool of persons from where to detect and formally identify victims of human trafficking.

## 4.8 THE NETHERLANDS DETECTS AND DETERS HUMAN TRAFFICKING THROUGH INNOVATIVE INVESTIGATORY TACTICS

### *Background*

The Netherlands is country of origin, transit and destination where women and girls are trafficked primarily for sexual exploitation.<sup>172</sup> Men and boys are trafficked for labour exploitation in the shipping industry, agriculture, horticulture, catering and food processing, and domestic/cleaning sector.<sup>173</sup>

In the Netherlands a significant number of trafficked persons are Dutch nationals.<sup>174</sup> Other EU nationals being trafficked in the Netherlands include Bulgarian, Hungarian and Romanian.<sup>175</sup> As to non-EU nationals commonly identified as trafficking victims in the Netherlands are women and girls recruited from South and East Asia, and Africa, as well as asylum seekers and unaccompanied minors.<sup>176</sup>

Traditionally, the approach to combatting the criminal network behind trafficking is to focus on sharing intelligence strictly among law enforcement and legal professionals. Today in the Netherlands, however, the more novel approach to combatting human trafficking calls for law enforcement to engage and collaborate with public and private entities that are in a position to help law enforcement erect barriers to disrupt the trafficking process.

### *Project Summary*

The **Barrier Model**, also referred to as the “programmatic approach”, was first used in 2006 by the Dutch authorities as a method to combat human trafficking.<sup>177</sup> The focus of the Barrier

<sup>172</sup> National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children, *A Report of Modern Forms of Slavery in the Netherlands, Data on Human Trafficking 2008-2012*, 2014. See generally, TRACE, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014; and U.S. State Department, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Netherlands*, 2014.

<sup>173</sup> Ibid.

<sup>174</sup> Ibid.

<sup>175</sup> Ibid.

<sup>176</sup> In the period 2008-2012, children made-up 15% of the victims registered, with a significant 62% of those minors being Dutch nationals. See, National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children, *A Report of Modern Forms of Slavery in the Netherlands, Data on Human Trafficking 2008-2012*, 2014.

<sup>177</sup> Developed by the Dutch Social Security Information and Investigation Service in 2005, the initial objective of the model was to map the public and private entities that were facilitating illegal employment in the Netherlands. See, Groenleer, Martijn and de Jong, Jorrit, *Wanted: Partners, The Challenges of Pioneering a Novel Approach*

Model is on creating structural barriers at five different stages of interaction known to enable traffickers to operate: namely admission (port entry), housing, identity, labour and financial flows.<sup>178</sup> The methodology is aimed at disrupting the criminal network from making a profit from its human trafficking activities, and this disruption has most effectively taken place during the following phases of the trafficking chain: border-crossing, identity docs, housing, employment site and financial transactions.<sup>179</sup>

Government and private service-providers responsible for enabling the above-mentioned phases are engaged as partners and are also trained to become more vigilant in detecting possible cases of human trafficking.<sup>180</sup>

For instance, window brothels in the red light district have had their business licenses revoked and forced to close due to suspected trafficking-related activities.<sup>181</sup> A number of escort agencies based in the Netherlands and linked to trafficking-related activities have had their websites shut down by the authorities.<sup>182</sup> Then, in relation to the closure of these websites, Dutch law enforcement sent text messages, also known as 'text bombs', to some 1300 mobile phones belonging to persons, most likely clients, associated with the illicit escort agencies.<sup>183</sup>

In another example, the Dutch agency responsible trained housing inspectors to engage in detecting cases of human trafficking in the course of their normal inspection activities as housing inspectors.<sup>184</sup> Moreover, the public is encouraged to anonymously report suspected cases of human trafficking through the national hotline<sup>185</sup>. The publication of the hotline is also used by the Dutch government in its public awareness campaign, with a particular interest in targeting clients of prostitution in the Netherlands.<sup>186</sup>

In terms of training activities, a partnership with the Dutch Hotel and Restaurant Association resulted in 300 hotel employees having received training as of 2011.

The Netherlands' Barrier Model has been publically recognized for its effectiveness, primarily because perpetrators are regularly indicted for trafficking and a significant

---

to *Fighting Human Trafficking in the Netherlands*, Dutch Public Prosecution Service and the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013.

<sup>178</sup> *Putting Rantsev into Practice: Handbook of Best Practices of Multidisciplinary Cooperation against Trafficking in Human Beings*, Ministry of Security and Justice of the Netherlands, Ministry of the Interior of Poland and Ministry of the Interior of Cyprus, 2013. The *Rantsev* publication was a practical follow-up to the ground breaking 2010 case of *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia*, in which the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) determined trafficking in human beings to fall within the scope of Article 4 of the European Convention on Human Rights. <http://www.atlep.org.uk/courses-and-events/training-papers-immigration/guide-to-the-judgment-in-rantsev-v-cyprus-and-russia/>

<sup>179</sup> Groenleer, Martijn and de Jong, Jorrit, *Wanted: Partners, The Challenges of Pioneering a Novel Approach to Fighting Human Trafficking in the Netherlands*, Dutch Public Prosecution Service and the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013.

<sup>180</sup> Ibid.

<sup>181</sup> In Utrecht, window brothels were forced to shut down for some time in 2013 after local authorities revoked their permits due to information about sexual exploitation on their premises. See, U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Netherlands*, 2014.

<sup>182</sup> U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Netherlands*, 2014.

<sup>183</sup> Ibid.

<sup>184</sup> Ibid.

<sup>185</sup> The Crime Stoppers Helpline (Meld Misdaad Anoniem) operating in the Netherlands.

<sup>186</sup> In the Netherlands, prostitution is regulated by law. See generally, TRACE Deliverable 1.1, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014;

percentage of the cases brought before the court lead to convictions.<sup>187</sup>

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Commitment levels differ among municipalities within the country (whereas some have taken on board the model, others claim there have no trafficking problem within their municipality).
- ✓ Although 300 hotel employees received training, a more significant impact would have been made if training activities had targeted all of the 300,000 hotel employees and 45,000 restaurant employees.<sup>188</sup>
- ✓ Hotels in the Netherlands continue to fail to recognize and report incidents of exploitation on their premises.
- ✓ Entry into the country takes place with limited inspection at entry borders, making it easier for trafficking victims to be entered into the country undetected by authorities at port entry.
- ✓ The use of the media can have both a positive and negative effect on the investigative operation. Following an operation, the media is generally used as a tool to raise awareness and publicise the outcome of a successful operation to the general public. Due to concerns of negative publicity, some collaborating partners from the private sector are not fully on-board with the tactic of involving the media. Public sector partners, such as prosecutors, also expressed concerns regarding the media's accessibility to potential prosecutorial evidence and witnesses.
- ✓ Capacity building training programs, targeting public and private partners involved in combatting trafficking should be continuous and sustainable.
- ✓ Within time, some collaborating partners lost their motivation and enthusiasm for the operations, this resulted in the partner relinquishing their new role as a barrier enactor and reverting to their former way of working.

### Promising Practices

- Creation of specialised investigative and inspection teams within the relevant public sector agencies (e.g., border control, immigration, labour inspectors, police, prosecutors, social benefits, work permit) strengthens victim identification efforts by frontline professionals.
- The partnership between the national prosecutors' office and the Dutch Association of Hotels resulted in the production of a training video for use by the association in training hotel employees how to better detect and report suspected cases of human trafficking.<sup>189</sup> This is in line with the association's industry-wide policy enacted in 2012 calling for the dismissal of hotel managers who fail to deter human trafficking from taking place on their premises.<sup>190</sup>

<sup>187</sup> Groenleer, Martijn and de Jong, Jorrit, *Wanted: Partners, The Challenges of Pioneering a Novel Approach to Fighting Human Trafficking in the Netherlands*, Dutch Public Prosecution Service and the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013. See also, *Putting Rantsev into Practice: Handbook of Best Practices of Multidisciplinary Cooperation against Trafficking in Human Beings*, Ministry of Security and Justice of the Netherlands, Ministry of the Interior of Poland and Ministry of the Interior of Cypress, 2013.

<sup>188</sup> Groenleer, Martijn and de Jong, Jorrit, *Wanted: Partners, The Challenges of Pioneering a Novel Approach to Fighting Human Trafficking in the Netherlands*, Dutch Public Prosecution Service and the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013.

<sup>189</sup> See U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: The Netherlands*, 2014; also CoMensha La Strada website: <http://lastradainternational.org/ls-offices/netherlands> or [www.comensha.nl](http://www.comensha.nl)

<sup>190</sup> National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children, *A Report of Modern Forms of Slavery in the Netherlands, Data on Human Trafficking 2008-2012*, 2014. See also, CoMensha La Strada website: [www.comensha.nl](http://www.comensha.nl) or [www.mensenhandel.nl](http://www.mensenhandel.nl)

- Private entities facilitate the operation of human trafficking, either intentionally or unintentionally, therefore it is a sound strategy to enlist the private sector as a partner in disrupting the human trafficking operation. Private sector partners may include, hotel industry, telecom providers, hospitals, abortion clinics, housing associations, transport companies, landlords.
- The tactic of publicly 'naming and shaming' hotel establishments known to have been involved or having failed to report human trafficking-related activities on their premises.
- Use media as a public education tool. Media exposure was instrumental in keeping the issue of human trafficking in the political agenda among decision-makers and policy-makers at the government level.
- Creation of a hotline specifically for ship-owners and sailors and aimed at collecting information about possible cases of trafficking for labour exploitation.

#### **4.9 ADSTRINGO: ADDRESSING TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS FOR LABOUR EXPLOITATION THROUGH IMPROVED PARTNERSHIPS, ENHANCED DIAGNOSTICS AND INTENSIFIED ORGANISATIONAL APPROACHES**

##### ***Background***

Free movement within the EU, competition in the market economy, and the pursuit of cost-effectiveness significantly increased the mobility of labour to and within Europe, including the Baltic Sea region.<sup>191</sup> In many labour intensive sectors, migrant labour became a cheap alternative to domestic labour.<sup>192</sup> Employers looked for cost-saving measures by recruiting workers from abroad.<sup>193</sup> Problems occur when cost-cutting leads to risky recruitment practices, unequal labour markets, and poor working conditions for migrant labourers.<sup>194</sup> In the most extreme of cases, workers become victims of trafficking for forced labour.<sup>195</sup>

Trafficking for labour exploitation had not been viewed as a priority on policy agendas in Europe, including the countries of the Baltic Sea region. The main focus of anti-trafficking policies in the region had been on trafficking for sexual exploitation, and victim assistance programs. Programs were mainly designed for women and children victims of sexual exploitation, leaving other at-risk groups unidentified and separated from the system of assistance.

The Baltic Sea region faced a growing awareness of the need to involve a broader spectrum of relevant actors in order to identify and assist victims of trafficking for labour exploitation, to develop knowledge and training efforts for both actors working directly with the issue of

---

<sup>191</sup> Sorrentino, Lilliana and Jokinen, Anniina, *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), 2014.

<sup>192</sup> Ibid.

<sup>193</sup> Ibid.

<sup>194</sup> Ibid.

<sup>195</sup> Sorrentino, L., Jokinen, A., *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), 2014: In recent years due to the changes in the labour market, increased competition and restructuring of work production affecting prices, private businesses are relying more on low skilled and low paid migrant workers. These workers are especially vulnerable to discrimination and to other exploitative practices, including trafficking for labour exploitation.

trafficking in human beings and actors who could be instrumental in identifying labour exploitation.

It was necessary to begin by collecting baseline information, identifying existing resources and addressing challenges encountered by different actors at the national level with regards to trafficking for labour exploitation.

The starting point for the development of the ADSTRINGO Project was findings from two research initiatives that had been previously conducted in the region and focused on how national stakeholders were combatting trafficking for labour exploitation.<sup>196</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

The project "**ADSTRINGO – Addressing Trafficking in Human Beings for Labour Exploitation through Improved Partnerships, Enhanced Diagnostics and Intensified Organisational Approaches**" sought to broaden the scope of actions against human trafficking for forced labour in the Baltic Sea region, to bring together strategic actors such as trade unions, labour associations, labour inspectors and tax authorities, and to create stronger partnerships against human trafficking for labour exploitation.

ADSTRINGO was a transnational project aimed at preventing trafficking for forced labour and labour exploitation through raising awareness and creating partnerships among stakeholders in the eleven countries of the Baltic Sea region: Denmark, Estonia, Finland, Germany, Iceland, Latvia, Lithuania, Norway, Poland, the Russian Federation, and Sweden.

ADSTRINGO was an EU-funded project implemented between 2012 and 2014 by the European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Lithuania, University of Tartu in Estonia, and Council of the Baltic Sea States Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings (CBSS TF-THB).<sup>197</sup>

The project used a multi-disciplinary approach to create an inclusive dynamic platform for exchanging experiences and knowledge among different actors, and built connections at the national, regional and international levels. Project activities brought together experts with many different perspectives mandates motivations and approaches towards trafficking for labour exploitation. It also allowed drawing on already tested models of combating trafficking for forced labour and labour exploitation by more experienced countries in this field, like Belgium, the Netherlands and the UK.

The research component of the project consisted of studying the links between recruitment, irregular employment practices and labour trafficking in six countries. The project also

---

<sup>196</sup> The European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, affiliated with the United Nations in cooperation with the University of Tartu and the University of Warsaw implemented the EC-funded FLEX project in 2009-2011 focusing on trafficking for labour exploitation. The Council of the Baltic Sea States initiated the project "DEFLECT - Data and Education on Forced Labour Exploitation and Counter Trafficking" funded by the Swedish International Development Agency in 2010 – 2013. Within the project a regional conference was organised and a baseline study completed, "Actors against Trafficking for Labour Exploitation".

<sup>197</sup> ADSTRINGO had been granted a flag ship project under the EU Strategy for the Baltic Sea Region and it fulfilled the Action – Combating Trafficking in Human Beings as a part of the overall Priority Area - CRIME. The project was financed by the Prevention of and Fight against Crime Programme of the European Commission, Directorate-General Home Affairs, Swedish Institute and the Danish Ministry of Gender Equality and Ecclesiastical Affairs.

provided opportunities for dialogue and exchange among stakeholders by hosting national, regional and international expert meetings on combating human trafficking and labour exploitation.

ADSTRINGO directly facilitated development of formal domestic inter-institutional networks. For example, in Latvia the established informal network against trafficking for labour exploitation has been formalized and included in the National Action Plan. In Sweden, a new step was taken towards countering trafficking in human beings for labour exploitation with the broadened mandate of the National Coordinator. Labour actors in Sweden were included in the nationwide national support operations team that had previously worked against trafficking for sexual exploitation. In Germany, the authorities envisage initiating a permanent dialogue of various experts in combating labour exploitation.<sup>198</sup>

ADSTRINGO developed guidelines for states, businesses, trade unions and civil society to prevent abusive recruitment, exploitative employment and the trafficking of migrant workers in the Baltic Sea region. Findings from both the research component and expert meetings were utilised in order to identify key issues and problems to include in the guidelines.

While the project and products were tailored to the Baltic Sea region, project results and guidelines could also be applied in the prevention of trafficking for forced labour and labour exploitation within the EU, particularly given that across Europe similar practices and challenges are being encountered.

### ***Lessons Learned***

- ✓ A broadened understanding of human trafficking for labour exploitation is needed, as well as a maintained momentum in tackling the problem.
- ✓ Finding an incentive for businesses may be the key to engaging the private sector as partners against human trafficking for labour exploitation.<sup>199</sup>
- ✓ The main limitations for cooperation among various actors at the national level are the different perspectives towards combating trafficking for labour exploitation; lack of a clear mandate on the part of partner organisations; and limited understanding about the roles and responsibilities of the relevant actors in the entire human trafficking process.
- ✓ Adequate assistance to male victims of trafficking for labour exploitation remains a challenge in most of the countries of the Baltic Sea region.<sup>200</sup>
- ✓ As the majority of victims for labour exploitation are not identified in the country of destination, targeted and tailor-made prevention efforts that aim at identifying and addressing risks at the recruitment stage is crucial and need to be intensified.
- ✓ Combating trafficking for labour exploitation requires the involvement of less traditional actors that may come in contact with victims of labour exploitation, such as labour inspectorates, employers and trade unions, recruitment agencies, tax authorities and other stakeholders.

---

<sup>198</sup> Germany's foreseen inter-institutional forum on trafficking for labour exploitation will complement Germany's Federal Working Group on Trafficking in Persons.

<sup>199</sup> ADSTRINGO project activities revealed that the private sector is generally reluctant to get involved in combating trafficking for labour exploitation, despite the risks and high penalties for being associated with trafficking for forced labour and labour exploitation.

<sup>200</sup> See supra note 183. According to the research, existing shelters and services in the region are usually designed for women and children, leaving male victims unprotected and vulnerable.

### ***Promising Practices***

- For the first time in the Baltic Sea region, key labour actors were given the opportunity to actively participate in the dialogue and trainings on trafficking for labour exploitation and establish communication channels between the various actors involved in combating trafficking in human beings. It is the institutionalisation of such cooperation networks that can have a concrete effect on the efforts against trafficking for labour exploitation.
- Trade unions in Finland and Denmark have been known to use the ‘name and shame’ approach in order to penalize employers engaged in exploitative practices against their migrant workers.<sup>201</sup> The tactic of publishing the name of the company being boycotted by the trade union also serves to potentially deter other companies from engaging in such practices.
- Trade unions in Sweden and Norway have partnered with other national organisations to establish information and service centres in their respective countries where undocumented migrant workers can receive in-person or anonymously via phone free information about labour law, collective agreements entered into by unions, healthcare services, immigration procedures and if applicable, referral to victim assistance services including legal assistance.<sup>202</sup>
- Finland has assigned a specialised team of labour inspectors to solely oversee inspections involving employers of migrant workers.<sup>203</sup> This team of inspectors can follow-up immediately on anonymous tips regarding possible cases of labour exploitation and can interview migrant workers during on-site inspections.<sup>204</sup>
- Trade unions in Germany, along with German civil society organizations and religious associations, have established migrant centres nation-wide where migrant workers can access free information and/or services, often in their own language, about various matters including migrant worker rights and duties, legal aid, access to housing and healthcare, recruitment and hiring regulations.<sup>205</sup> Germany also published and disseminated an information guide aimed specifically at raising awareness among Romanian migrant workers in Germany.<sup>206</sup>
- In Denmark, the national initiative of the Danish Centre against Human Trafficking developed the handbook “Managing the Risk of Hidden Forced Labour – A Guide for Companies and Employers” for companies and employers.<sup>207</sup>

## **4.10 COMBAT: TACKLING HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BULGARIA, LITHUANIA AND THE UK**

### ***Background***

**Lithuania** is a source, transit and destination country for human trafficking in sexual and labour exploitation, and forced criminal activity.<sup>208</sup> Lithuanian victims are trafficked mainly

<sup>201</sup> Sorrentino, L., Jokinen, A., *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), 2014.

<sup>202</sup> Ibid, pp76.

<sup>203</sup> Ibid, pp34.

<sup>204</sup> Ibid.

<sup>205</sup> Ibid, pp77. See, <https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking>

<sup>206</sup> Ibid.

<sup>207</sup> Danish Board of Social Service, 2014. See, [https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/guidelines\\_risk\\_management\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/guidelines_risk_management_en.pdf)

in the UK, followed by Germany, the Netherlands, and Nordic countries.<sup>209</sup> In Lithuania, victims are recruited by a small criminal group of Lithuanian men specialised in the recruitment of trafficking victims from the Baltic countries, to be transported to Western Europe, and then sold to other criminal groups most likely from the Balkans.<sup>210</sup>

Lithuanian authorities estimate that a high percentage of women and girls are sexually exploited domestically, as well.<sup>211</sup> Vulnerable groups in Lithuania include institutionalised children (orphanages and foster homes), poorly educated young women from rural villages, physically and mentally challenged persons.<sup>212</sup>

Trafficking victims of labour exploitation identified in Lithuania include men from Bulgaria, while Lithuanian men have been known to be trafficked for labour exploitation in the UK, among other countries.<sup>213</sup> Traffickers associated with the human trafficking network in Lithuania have been predominately nationals of Latvia, Lithuania and Eastern European countries.<sup>214</sup>

In the **UK** a small network of mainly men, originating from the Balkan region, control the smuggling and human trafficking operations.<sup>215</sup> Traffickers use ‘trusted’ contacts in the UK to communicate with traffickers in source countries such as Bulgaria and Lithuania, who arrange for the recruitment and transport of persons, primarily for sexual exploitation, but also increasingly for labour exploitation.<sup>216</sup>

Victims of sexual exploitation recruited to the UK tend to be poorly educated young women and girls from remote rural towns in the country of origin, and from severely impoverished or dysfunctional families.<sup>217</sup> Often the young woman or girl has moved from her village to a major city with the aspiration of finding work and escaping poverty.<sup>218</sup>

Some victims of trafficking identified in the UK have been known to come from or through southern central **Bulgaria**, bordering Greece and Turkey. The region is known as Europe’s southernmost border, and recognised as a transiting area for victims being trafficked from Asia through Turkey and into Bulgaria, Greece and onwards to the UK.<sup>219</sup>

Upon arrival of the trafficked person in the UK, s/he is inspected normally at the entry port (e.g., airport) and possibly sold onsite to a trafficker, normally, if the trafficked person is

<sup>208</sup> Council of the Baltic Sea States, *Human Trafficking 2013, Baltic Sea Region Round-up*, 2013. See generally, Lithuania Protection Project Report 2011; and UNODC, *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, 2014.

<sup>209</sup> Ibid.

<sup>210</sup> UNODC, *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, 2014.

<sup>211</sup> U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report, Lithuania*, 2014.

<sup>212</sup> Ibid.

<sup>213</sup> Ibid.

<sup>214</sup> See supra note 160.

<sup>215</sup> Webb, Sarah and Burrows, John, *Organised Immigration Crime: A Post-Conviction Study*, 2009.

<sup>216</sup> Interview with a trafficker in the UK: “You’ve got to stop people from Lithuania – that is where it comes from – it’s not people over here. They sell the girls for the first time. The Lithuanians – they’ve even got housing here, they bring over 15–20 girls a week and they bring them over here and keep them over here and they sell them around to people.” Webb, Sarah and Burrows, John, *Organised Immigration Crime: A Post-Conviction Study*, 2009, pp15.

<sup>217</sup> Webb, Sarah and Burrows, John, *Organised Immigration Crime: A Post-Conviction Study*, 2009.

<sup>218</sup> Ibid.

<sup>219</sup> COMBAT organized activities specifically in the Bulgarian southern central rural town of Haskovo. See, Barrett H. and Beecham D., *COMBAT Combining against Trafficking, Final Evaluation Report*, Coventry University, 2013.

deemed unsuitable, s/he can be returned to the country of origin, sent to another destination, or ‘exchanged’ between local UK traffickers.<sup>220</sup>

The sexual exploitation of trafficking victims takes place in private flats, saunas, massage parlours and brothels.<sup>221</sup> The use of daily rented space at different brothels is common, due to space and demand.<sup>222</sup>

### ***Project Summary***

The project **Combining against Trafficking (COMBAT)** developed and implemented educational resources and awareness-raising activities targeting at-risk groups, primarily children, in three inter-connected countries: Bulgaria, Lithuania and the UK. The three partner countries were chosen because traffickers recruit in source countries like Bulgaria and Lithuania, then transport victims to the UK, predominately a destination country for trafficking in human beings.

The EU-funded two-year project was implemented in partnership with the Bulgarian Opportunity and Protection Association, UK-based Coventry, Solihull & Warwickshire Partnership and Kaunas Women’s Association of Lithuania.<sup>223</sup>

The educational materials and resources utilised by the project were customized to reflect the trafficking situation within the context of each country. General information about the domestic legal and policy framework, as well as the identification of local partners and local service providers, were incorporated into the materials and resources distributed.

Social media campaign played a prominent role in the COMBAT project activities. In total, by the close of the two-year project, the COMBAT website had received 69,721 online visitors, the project’s Twitter account had 90 followers and Facebook had 43 ‘likes’.<sup>224</sup>

In **Bulgaria** and **Lithuania**, countries of origin, COMBAT organised roundtable discussions with frontline professionals, e.g., social workers, immigration officers, teachers, police officers. Professionals working with at-risk and vulnerable groups were also targeted for sensitization on the risk factors and recruiting methodologies associated with human trafficking.

In **Bulgaria** and **Lithuania**, COMBAT also organised interactive group games and group discussions. Children participating in the project’s peer-to-peer program learned about the dangers of human trafficking in a safe and child-friendly environment. The peer-to-peer activities involved approximately 314 children in Lithuania and 377 in Bulgaria.

In the **UK**, sensitisation workshops were conducted with 1449 frontline professionals, e.g., law enforcement, hospitality and transportation. A targeted public education campaign was launched in anticipation of the 2012 Summer Olympics in London.<sup>225</sup>

---

<sup>220</sup> Webb, Sarah and Burrows, John, *Organised Immigration Crime: A Post-Conviction Study*, 2009.

<sup>221</sup> Ibid.

<sup>222</sup> Ibid.

<sup>223</sup> Funded by the EU Daphne Program. See, Barrett H. and Beecham D., *COMBAT Combining against Trafficking, Final Evaluation Report*, Coventry University, 2013. [www.combattrafficking.eu](http://www.combattrafficking.eu)

<sup>224</sup> Ibid.

<sup>225</sup> Ibid.

Professionals trained by COMBAT were expected to continue sharing the knowledge and skills acquired, and to serve as key resource persons in their local communities.

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ The project does not appear to have been integrated into Lithuania's legal or policy framework against human trafficking (i.e., national referral mechanism, action plan, inter-agency coordination body) and thus, perhaps placing into question the longer-term sustainability of results achieved.
- ✓ Project activities were implemented in three inter-related countries; for instance, labour trafficking victims identified in Lithuania included Bulgarian men, and Lithuanian men have been exploited for labour in the UK. Yet, it is not made clear to what extent findings from activities implemented in one country fed into the activities of the other countries, with the objective of creating synergy and adding-value to project results. Unclear also as to what type of support and assistance is available to trafficked men in the partner countries.

### Promising Practices

- Simultaneous implementation in the source and destination countries allow for findings and results in the country of origin to be useful to anti-trafficking efforts in both countries.
- Raising awareness about human trafficking vulnerability factors and recruitment methodologies in poor rural and border towns (where the widespread recruitment of victims for human trafficking has been well documented).
- Using social media to expand the reach of the awareness-raising activities.
- Incorporating the methodology of peer-to-peer learning
- Sensitising frontline professionals who then become community resource persons.
- Customizing project activities, resources and materials based on the trafficking situation in each country targeted by the project.

## 4.11 REACT: RAISING AWARENESS AND EMPOWERMENT AGAINST CHILD TRAFFICKING IN BULGARIA, DENMARK, ITALY, AND ROMANIA

### *Background*

While modern technology has offered society vast opportunities, it has also caused society some unique challenges. For example, modern technology has increasingly become the key tool used by human traffickers to conduct the business of human trafficking by recruiting, grooming and marketing their victims online.<sup>226</sup> Technology has increased the ability of this criminal network to remain hidden, invisible; thereby, further solidifying the notion that trafficking in human beings remains a low-risk high-profit business. Traffickers organize, coordinate, advertise, buy and sell online or through the use of mobile phone communication. Most at-risk of being enticed online or by mobile phone into an exploitative situation are children and vulnerable youths. But, in order to better understand the nexus between modern technology and trafficking more focused research is needed. Research which will in turn better inform efforts by Member States to develop effective interventions relevant to the shifting nature of trafficking in human beings, and particularly child trafficking.

---

<sup>226</sup> See generally, TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014; TRACE, *Report on the Relevant Aspects of the Trafficking Act and its Possible Evolution in Response to Law Enforcement*, 2015; and Organization for Security Cooperation in Europe, *Analysing the Business Model of Trafficking in Human Beings to Better Prevent the Crime*, Global Initiative to Fight Trafficking, 2012.

### ***Project Summary***

The REACT project worked with at-risk children to design and develop an awareness-raising campaign focused on the link between modern technology and human trafficking in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy and Romania.<sup>227</sup>

The project resulted in the development of key messages based on survey results and discussions with the children participants of the project:

- Bulgaria: *To be seated comfortably in front of the computer does not make you invincible*
- Denmark: *Know your rights, don't listen to traffickers, you can get protection here*
- Romania: 1) *Be careful who you trust* and 2) *Use the internet carefully! Trafficking in minors has hidden faces*<sup>228</sup>
- Italy: *Internet is useful and fun, but be aware of the risks*

The two-year multi-country initiative was funded by the EU and implemented in partnership with Bulgarian Animus Association Foundation, General Inspectorate of Romanian Police, and Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), Save the Children Denmark and Save the Children Italy.<sup>229</sup>

REACT included a survey activity involving over 300 children who were interviewed as primary informants, along with 130 other stakeholders, such as social workers, childcare professionals, outreach workers, law enforcement agents, legal professionals, organizations and computer industry consultants.<sup>230</sup>

Child protection policies, including child-friendly language and environment were designed into the project and adhered to during the project implementation process.<sup>231</sup> The at-risk groups targeted by REACT consisted of repatriated child victims, child survivors of internal trafficking, foreign unaccompanied minors (child asylum-seekers), children from the ethnic-Roma community, institutionalised children, among others.<sup>232</sup>

Project activities began with focused research examining the target group's level of access, exposure, familiarity, motivation and awareness of risk factors with regards to the usage of modern technology, defined as mobile phones, online private chat rooms, dating websites, social media networks, free online games, webcams, etc.<sup>233</sup> Research also examined the use of strategies and means used by traffickers in the recruitment of child victims, identify the profile of children most at risk of being trafficked through online recruitment.<sup>234</sup>

According to the research, destination countries like Italy and Denmark had a scarcity of data connecting modern technology with human trafficking; whereas countries of origin, in this

---

<sup>227</sup> Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011.

<sup>228</sup> These messages were prepared by a group of ten children involved in the preparation of the awareness campaign in Romania. Meetings were held with the group of children to identify the best key messages which would have the desired impact on children and young adults. A message designed and created by children for children at risk was an added value to the campaign and to the entire project.

<sup>229</sup> Ibid. Funded under the EU Daphne Program.

<sup>230</sup> Ibid.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid.

<sup>232</sup> Ibid.

<sup>233</sup> Ibid.

<sup>234</sup> Ibid.

case Romania and Bulgaria, found some evidence linking the use of modern technology with the propensity for being recruited into human trafficking. Apparently, a child's inability to understand the language meant that even if an attempt at online recruitment or online grooming was being made, the child would, in all likelihood, not understand.

A sense of anonymity and independence was the motivation provided by child internet-users engaged in risky online behaviour. To gain social status and material possessions were two additional reasons children engaged in such behaviour.

The strongest connection between the use of new technology and human trafficking was established in **Bulgaria**, where a close connection between internet, prostitution, and escort agencies was established as a result of easy accessibility to escort agencies and similar websites.<sup>235</sup>

In **Denmark**, child trafficking for sexual exploitation, forced begging and forced criminal activities is prevalent. Vulnerable groups in Denmark are unaccompanied minors from Afghanistan (refugees of 15-17 years of age), children from the Baltic countries, Bulgaria, Hungary, Romania and Slovakia and other Eastern European countries (minors from Nigeria have also been identified).<sup>236</sup> In Denmark, often the trafficker accompanying the child is referred to as the aunt, uncle, father, grandmother; thereby, making it difficult to confirm if the adult who accompanied the minor into the country of destination also recruited the child and if so was the recruitment conducted online.<sup>237</sup> Consequently, the data gathered in Denmark was unable to establish a link between the child's use of technology and the child's travel or stay in Denmark.<sup>238</sup>

Unaccompanied minors (child asylum-seekers) residing at reception centres generally limited their use of mobile phones to in-coming calls.<sup>239</sup> The children went online to search for information about their host country (the country of destination).<sup>240</sup> They were also users of social network sites to maintain contact with family and friends in their country of origin. Unaccompanied foreign minors who run away from the asylum reception centres are at-risk of being trafficked or re-trafficked.<sup>241</sup>

In **Italy**, the data available was unable to show a clear nexus between technology and trafficking, with the exception of perhaps cases of children smuggled into the country who used mobile phones while in transit.<sup>242</sup> Vulnerable children in Italy tend to be nationals of

---

<sup>235</sup> Traffickers used "luring offers", offers to earn fast money, the "manipulation and stimulation of the desire for material goods." Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011, pp8.

<sup>236</sup> Ibid.

<sup>237</sup> Ibid.

<sup>238</sup> "The risk...with the growing use of new technology is that they may be recruited in this way unbeknownst to all." Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011, pp16.

<sup>239</sup> Ibid.

<sup>240</sup> Ibid.

<sup>241</sup> Ibid.

<sup>242</sup> Ibid.

Afghanistan, Moldova, Romania, Albania, Sudan, Egypt, and Nigeria.<sup>243</sup> Ethnic-Roma girls were perceived as being more at risk of being recruited or groomed online.<sup>244</sup>

When compared to Italian children, foreign children residing in Italy appeared more resilient when faced with a questionable or dangerous circumstance, and therefore also appeared to be more defiant when approached online by strangers.<sup>245</sup> This resilience and defiance may (or may not) be indicative of the impact of a raised level of awareness about risk factors.<sup>246</sup>

In **Romania**, a country of origin for human trafficking, the data available only alluded to the possibility of a nexus between the use of technology and child trafficking.<sup>247</sup> The general trend continues to be that the recruiter is primarily a person known to the child: close friend, relative, boyfriend (*lover boy*).<sup>248</sup> A new trafficking trend in Romania involves emotionally troubled pre-adolescents from financially stable families being identified as trafficking victims.<sup>249</sup>

### Lessons Learned

- ✓ Factors of vulnerability leading to an increase of in risk of being recruited into human trafficking include: adolescence with very low self-esteem, who are naive (propensity to take everything in good faith) or have a (false) sense of invulnerability; a history of poverty, family violence, neglect or abandonment; member of a marginalized minority community (e.g., Roma).
- ✓ Ethnic-Roma children do not necessarily have less access to modern technology when compared to other children in the project's target group.
- ✓ Mobile phone usage begins between the ages of 7-8 for boys, and 10-11 for girls.
- ✓ The level of familiarity using modern technology was a differentiating factor among the project's target group. Notably, the less experienced child internet-user was more aware of privacy issues than the more experienced user who was more prone to engage in risky online behaviour. Possibly over time the more experienced internet-user has lowered his/her guard due to a sense of security about having mastered online risk factors.
- ✓ Despite increase in the use of modern technology to recruit potential victims of human trafficking, children continue to be recruited and exploited through family members, friends and other persons known to the child.

---

<sup>243</sup> Ibid. See generally, TRACE, *Report on the Relevant Aspects of the Trafficking Act and its Possible Evolution in Response to Law Enforcement*, 2015.

<sup>244</sup> "Romanian boys of Roma origin who had lived in Italy from a young age were consulted... They raised the issue of girls who came from Romania and the fact that they were likely to end up exploited in the sex industry if they could not look after themselves." Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011, pp20.

<sup>245</sup> Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011.

<sup>246</sup> Ibid.

<sup>247</sup> Out of "20 minor victims identified in the investigation by the police, none (of the minors) reported what happened to them because they were afraid, ashamed, and manipulated by the adults who exploited them." Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011pp11.

<sup>248</sup> The term 'Lover Boy' was coined to describe a situation in which the recruiter feigns a romantic relationship with his potential victim in order to deceive her into an exploitative relationship, and eventually into being trafficked.

<sup>249</sup> The REACT report is unclear as to what is meant by emotional problems, perhaps not a diagnosed disability, but rather the emotional complexities typically associated with adolescent years.

**Promising Practices**

- Inclusive and participatory methodology used by REACT to implement project activities contributed towards its successful outcome.
- Empirical data collected will help guide and design future initiatives to prevent child trafficking and improve the identification of at-risk children.
- This multi-country initiative exemplifies innovative comparative research of an emerging trend aimed at helping Member States to better understand the link between modern technology and human trafficking.

## 5 LIST OF ADDITIONAL PROJECTS REVIEWED

### **ELGIUM - preventive campaign against human trafficking in Brazil and Belgium**

The overall objective of the project was to prevent Brazilian migrants from becoming victims of labour exploitation in Belgium. The project implemented a parallel awareness-raising campaign in Brazil and Belgium. This approach allowed the Government of Belgium to address the problem of human trafficking in both destination and source countries, thereby adding value and extending the reach of the campaign's target group. The project was implemented 2009-2010 with the financial and operational support from the Belgian Immigration Services. <https://dofi.ibz.be/sites/dvzoe/index.html>

### **BULARIA – youth clubs against human trafficking**

The Open Your Eyes Club initiative was an awareness raising campaign targeting children and youths in the Veliko Turnovo region of Bulgaria. The project established youth clubs throughout Veliko Turnovo following a survey indicating a low level of awareness about human trafficking among the youths. While at the clubs, children and youths, aged 7-18 years, participated in peer discussions and identified protection strategies on how not to fall victim to human trafficking. The initiative was implemented 2007-2008 by the Bulgarian National Commission for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, Association St. Ivan Rilski, Balvan Village Police Station, with the support of the International Organisation for Migration. <https://www.veliko-tarnovo.bg/bg/>

### **CoGUIDE- common guidelines and procedures for the identification of victims**

The CoGuide, implemented under the auspices of the TrafGulD project, provided research and activities aimed at developing common guidelines and procedures for the identification of trafficked persons in the EU. The project enhanced the effectiveness of the victim-identification process by offering Member States coherent and standardized procedures. The EU-funded 2011-2013 project was implemented in six Member States, including Bulgaria, France, Greece, Romania, Spain and the Netherlands. Project partners included: France Expertise Nationale, Council of Europe, ICMPD, ILO and UNODC. [http://www.fei.gouv.fr/files/Brochure%20ISEC\\_ENG%20janvier%202013.pdfEuro](http://www.fei.gouv.fr/files/Brochure%20ISEC_ENG%20janvier%202013.pdfEuro)

### **COMP.ACT - improving access to justice and compensation for trafficked persons**

The COMP.ACT (European Action Pact for Compensation for Trafficked Persons) project aimed to improve access to justice and to guarantee compensation for trafficked persons. *De jure* access to compensation by trafficking victims exist, *de facto* however, victims face a number of challenges in accessing their right to compensation for damages suffered while being trafficked. There are a number of systematic obstacles or procedural barriers in some Member States hindering the access to compensation. The COMP.ACT project identified these challenges and recommended relevant reforms. The project also developed national training handbooks for use by professionals in the criminal justice system. The project was implemented 2009-2012 by La Strada International Network and Anti-Slavery International. <http://www.compactproject.org/>

### **CONNECT – better protection and integration of unaccompanied children**

CONNECT focused on strengthening EU policies for unaccompanied children, a group known for being especially vulnerable to the recruitment methods of traffickers. CONNECT resulted in two mapping exercises, development of legal and policy resource tools and a comparative report on the situation of unaccompanied minors in Italy, Sweden, the Netherlands and the UK. The EU-funded project was implemented 2013-2014 by Save the

Children Sweden, in partnership with UNHCR, Save the Children Italy, Don Calabria Institute (Italy), Stichting Nidos, (Netherlands), and Coram Children's Legal Center (United Kingdom). <http://www.connectproject.eu/>

### **DENMARK – a holistic approach to supporting trafficked persons**

Denmark's HopeNow is a civil society organization working to empower trafficked persons, both men and women, through advocacy, awareness-raising and community outreach in Denmark. The organization provides victims with free services including legal aid, healthcare, therapy, education, rehabilitation, reintegration skills and referral to other services. HopeNow produced a documentary featuring the lives of trafficked persons in Denmark which was been widely disseminated and utilized as a public education tool. Hope Now was the first place winner of the 2014 European Crime Prevention Best Practice Award.

<http://hopenow.dk/en/about-human-trafficking/human-trafficking-in-denmark/>

### **ENotes – online clearinghouse of anti-trafficking information in the EU**

This online initiative, implemented collected data and reported on anti-trafficking policies, laws and initiatives in EU Member States. The project envisaged establishing an online reporting mechanism for use by the civil society community to monitor Member State policies and initiatives against trafficking in human beings. The EU-funded project was implemented 2008-2009 by the European NGOs Observatory in partnership with Association on the Road (Italy), ACCEM (Spain), La Strada International (Netherlands), and ALC/SPRS (France). <http://www.e-notes-observatory.org/project/>

### **ESTONIA - offering practical and legal information through a helpline**

The civil society organization Living for Tomorrow supports trafficked persons in Estonia through the services of a helpline. The helpline provides callers with practical and legal information related to migration, working abroad, studying abroad and marriage abroad. The caller can also receive referral services to other support programs available from the state and non-governmental organizations in Estonia. The information received through the helpline services allows the caller to make informed decisions based on facts, and thereby lessening the risk of being exploited while in transit or abroad. For a victim of trafficking, the helpline services provide him/her with information on how and where to find protection and support in Estonia and abroad. Operational since 2004, the helpline has provided over 5000 anonymous consultations. The helpline was funded by Estonia, Netherlands and Norway, among others.

<http://lft.ee/human-trafficking/hotline-service>

### **Free2Work – empowering consumers against labour trafficking**

The Free2Work initiative makes available to consumers information on “the story behind the bar code,” in order to inform consumers whether the products they are buying are associated with human trafficking for forced labour, including child labour. The website enables consumers to search more than 10,000 products and 400 brands and learn more about the various labor standards and corporate practices. Free2Work grades companies on a scale of A to F based on supply chain transparency, codes of conduct, responses to child and forced labor. Information is also available as to the efforts of companies to empower their employees (e.g., certification programs). The ranking list of companies is also available as a smart phone application. <http://www.free2work.org>

### **LATVIA - Info-Trailer as a visual exhibition against human trafficking**

The Info-Trailer, implemented by the civil society organization Safe House Shelter, is literally a physical caravan of 2 by 3 meters, with a design printed on the outside of the caravan and

clearly visible on the rear is the 24/7 helpline. Inside the caravan, an exhibition has been staged through the use of common symbols such as a wedding dress, construction tools, a map, a simple bed, basic food items, etc., to depict life in a room as a victim of trafficking for labour exploitation, sham marriage or sexual exploitation. It also includes an exhibition on persons exploited for the purpose of transporting drugs (drug mules). The Info-Trailer is used in training courses for professionals, as well. The project has been operational since 2013 and is funded by various private and public donors.

<http://patverums-dm.lv/lv/no-future-for-human-trafficking-6-un-7-diena>

#### **LITHUANIA – supporting repatriation and reintegration in the Panevezys Region**

The Panevezys Region of Lithuania is considered vulnerable due to its high criminality and poor local resources. The project aimed to support the repatriation and reintegration of former trafficking victims by establishing a network of trained support professionals and raising the level of sensitivity among community members. The project involved former victims by inviting them to share their stories of exploitation, escape and survival. The project activities were implemented by civil society organization Caritas Lithuania between 2012-2014 with funds from the Governments of Lithuania and Germany.

<http://www.anti-trafficking.lt/article/prekyba-zmonemis-nuo-vaiku-iki-vyru-sekundelt-2013-10-25>

#### **NGOs&Co – public-private engagement in combatting human trafficking**

The NGO&CO project aims to raise awareness and reduce market demand for products and services involving the use of labour exploitation. The project seeks to identify “a point of intersection” between civil society organizations and the private sector. The project intends to develop a toolkit on public-private partnerships, conduct focused research on corporate responsibility policies and practices, increase awareness levels within the private sector about human trafficking. The EU-funded project is being implemented 2014-2016 jointly by La Strada International Network members, Bulgaria, the Netherlands, Poland and Czech Republic, in cooperation with UNODC, IOM, ILO and ECPAT. <http://usedineurope.com/> and <http://lastradainternational.org/about-lsi/projects/ngos+co>

#### **POLAND– helpline services targeting marginalized group**

ISZTAR provided persons involved in the commercial sex industry in Poland with information, consultation and assistance through a free helpline service. This group of vulnerable and marginalized persons is often unaware of their legal rights, or do not know how and where to access basic legal and medical assistance. The project was implemented by La Strada Poland and financed by the Global Fund for Women during 2012-2013.

<http://strada.org.pl/index.php/pl/la-strada-w-dzialaniu/realizowane-projekty>

#### **PROTECT Children on the Move – protecting children exposed to exploitation and trafficking in cross border situations**

The PROTECT project focused on strengthening national and transnational child protection systems for children on the move in the Baltic Sea Region and beyond. One major finding is that the exploitation of children can occur at any point in the migration cycle including in the destination country and after being returned to the country of origin. The project, implemented in 2013-2015, resulted in five expert meetings for frontline professionals and policy-makers, focused research on key relevant issues and the development of Guidelines and a report. Furthermore, the project intends to develop a Wiki on transnational child protection. The project was implemented by the Council of Baltic Sea States Expert Group for Cooperation on Children-at-Risk (CBSS-EGCC) in partnership with the Latvian State Border

Guard, Lithuanian State Child Protection and Adoption Service, and Stockholm Social Emergency Centre. It was funded by the European Return Fund and CBSS. In 2015-2016, the results and tools from the PROTECT project will be used to train stakeholders in the Baltic Sea Region. <http://www.childcentre.info/>

### **RACE - increasing knowledge about forced criminal activities and begging in Europe**

The research project increased knowledge and identified good practices in responding to labour exploitation and forced begging. The most prevalent emerging trend in child trafficking is labour exploitation in cannabis cultivation. Within the EU, Vietnam is the most common country of origin for trafficked children, followed by Albania, China, Czech Republic, Jamaica, Poland and Somalia. Debt bondage is a common means by which the trafficked person and his/her family are controlled. Poor health and sanitation conditions, restricted freedoms, mental and physical abuse are common conditions for children forced to work on cannabis farms. The RACE project also explored labour exploitation involving sham marriages, drug trafficking, illegal charity collections and counterfeit goods. The EU-funded 2012-2014 project was implemented jointly by Anti-Slavery International UK, ECPAT UK, Specialist Policing Consultancy, Vietnamese Mental Health Association, Ireland Migrant Rights Centre Ireland (MRCI), La Strada Czech Republic, Multicultural Centre Prague and the Netherlands Police Academy.

[http://www.antislavery.org/english/what\\_we\\_do/programme\\_and\\_advocacy\\_work/trafficking/race.aspx](http://www.antislavery.org/english/what_we_do/programme_and_advocacy_work/trafficking/race.aspx)

### **SLOVAKIA – child protection handbook about being safe online**

The Sheeplive child protection project 2013-2014, published a handbook for use by teachers, social workers, police and non-government organizations on how to teach children and adolescents to avoid risky online behavior. The handbook contains interactive activities, and games aimed at enhancing the child's learning experience. The handbook also highlights other available resource tools and advice for children on how to remain safe while online.

[http://sheeplive.eu/sites/default/files/children\\_in\\_the\\_web\\_0.pdf](http://sheeplive.eu/sites/default/files/children_in_the_web_0.pdf)

### **SWEDEN - private sector's corporate responsibility against human trafficking**

The Corporate Compass project aimed to support corporations in establishing ethical guidelines against trafficking and strengthening the capacity of corporations to detect and deter human trafficking. The project developed information material and educational tool kits for use by the private sector in preventing human trafficking. Between 2012-2013, the project reached over 200 corporations. The project was implemented by the Swedish Women's Lobby, in collaboration with the Swedish Association of Women's Shelters and Young Women's Empowerment Centres and The National Organisation for Women's Shelters and Young Women's Shelters in Sweden. <http://sverigeskvinnolobby.se/en/project/corporate-compass/> and <http://www.rattriktning.se/home/>

### **SWEDEN – public awareness campaign against child sexual exploitation**

'Kampanjen Resekurage' (Campaign Travel Courage) is a Swedish public awareness campaign against the sexual exploitation of children. The initiative is being implemented by the County Administrative Board of Stockholm and World Childhood Foundation in cooperation with the National Police. The campaign aims to raise the level of awareness among the public in Sweden about child sexual tourism, and the various ways in which Swedes traveling abroad can report incidents of suspected cases of child sexual exploitation. The option of reporting suspected criminal activity anonymously online (through the campaign's webpage) may encourage more persons to come forward with information helpful

towards combatting child sexual tourism by Swedes in other countries. Launched in 2014 and funded by the Swedish government, the campaign will be displayed at airports, shuttle trains, shuttle buses, as well as disseminated through social media and digital channels. Promotional materials produced include a film, stickers, flyers, posters and digital banners for web sites and intranets. [www.resekurage.se](http://www.resekurage.se) and [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q2fuu94i\\_5w](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q2fuu94i_5w)

**UNITED KINGDOM– empowering survivors of trafficking through employment**

Beulah London is a UK-based private sector fashion company empowering survivors of human trafficking by providing them with employment opportunities. The company sells fashionable Beulah bags manufactured by former trafficking victims in the red-light district of Kolkata, India. Fair wages, health insurance and training are provided to each of the 150 women employed by the company. Additionally, the company donates 50% of its sales directly to awareness and advocacy projects fighting human trafficking. <https://www.beulahlondon.com>

**ACRONYMS**

<b>A</b>	
<b>ADPARE</b>	Association for Developing Alternative Practices for Reintegration and Education
<b>ADSTRINGO</b>	Addressing Trafficking in Human Beings for Labour Exploitation Through Improved Partnerships, Enhanced Diagnostics and Intensified Organizational Approaches
<b>ANITP</b>	Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons
<b>C</b>	
<b>CBSS TF-THB</b>	Council of the Baltic Sea States Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings
<b>CBSS EGCC</b>	Council of the Baltic Sea States Expert Group for Cooperation on Children-at-Risk
<b>COMBAT</b>	Combining against Human Trafficking
<b>E</b>	
<b>ECHR</b>	European Court of Human Rights
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>H</b>	
<b>HEUNI</b>	European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, in affiliation with the United Nations
<b>I</b>	
<b>ICMPD</b>	International Centre for Migration Policy Development
<b>M</b>	
<b>MRCI</b>	Migrant Rights Centre Ireland
<b>N</b>	
<b>NRM</b>	National Referral Mechanisms
<b>R</b>	
<b>REACT</b>	Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking
<b>S</b>	
<b>SE-TRM</b>	Sweden - Transnational Referral Mechanism
<b>SOPS</b>	Standard Operating Procedures
<b>STROM</b>	Strengthening the Role of Municipalities
<b>T</b>	
<b>TRM</b>	Transnational Referral Mechanisms
<b>TRACE</b>	Trafficking as a Criminal Enterprise

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Anti-Slavery International UK, *RACE: Trafficking for Forced Criminal Activities and Begging in Europe, An Exploratory Study and Good Practice Examples*, 2013.

Barrett H. and Beecham D., *COMBAT: Combining against Trafficking, Final Evaluation Report*, Coventry University, 2013.

Dobрева, Natasha, *Country Report: Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria*, Animus Association Foundation, 2013.

Dwyer, P., Lewis, H., Scullion, L. and Waite, L., *Forced Labour and UK Immigration Policy: Status Matters*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2011.

Council of the Baltic Sea States Expert Group for Cooperation on Children-at-Risk (EGCC), *Recommendation from the Conference on How to Enhance Assistance to Victims of Human Trafficking in the Baltic Region*, March 2014.

Council of the Baltic Sea States, *Human Trafficking 2013, Baltic Sea Region Round-up*, 2013.

Council of the Baltic Sea States Task-force on Trafficking in Human Beings (TF-THB), International Organization for Migration (IOM), *Handbook for Diplomatic and Consular Personnel on How to Assist and Protect Victims of Human Trafficking*, 2011.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Bulgaria*, 2011.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by France*, 2013.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report concerning the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Ireland*, 2013.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Romania*, 2012.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in Sweden*, 2014.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report Concerning the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings in the United Kingdom*, 2012.

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Reply from Finland to the Questionnaire for the Evaluation of the Implementation*

*of the Council of European Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties, 2014.*

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Reply from Sweden to the Questionnaire for the Evaluation of the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2013.*

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report submitted by the Bulgarian Authorities on Measures taken to Comply with Committee of the Parties Recommendation CP (2012) on the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2014.*

Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), *Report submitted by the Romanian Authorities on Measures taken to Comply with Committee of the Parties Recommendation CP (2012)7 on the Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2014.*

County Administrative Board of Stockholm, *Annual Report, 2014 (available in Swedish as Årsredovisning 2014).*

ECPAT UK, *Missing Out: A Study of Child Trafficking in the North-West, North East, and West Midlands, 2007.*

European Commission, *Asylum proposals: a more protective and effective Common European Asylum System (CEAS), 2011.*

European Commission, *Eurostat: Statistical Working Paper on Trafficking in Human Beings, 2014.*

European Commission, *Mid-term Report on the Implementation of the EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings, COM (2014) 635 final, 2014.*

European Crime Prevention Network, *Best Practice Conference, December 2014.*

European Crime Prevention Award: Country Application for Finland, 2014.

European Crime Prevention Award: Country Application for France, 2014.

European Crime Prevention Award: Country Application for Poland, 2014.

European Crime Prevention Award: Country Application for Romania, 2014.

European Migration Network Study, *Identification of victims of trafficking in human beings in international protection and forced return procedures, 2014.*

European NGOs Observatory, *Report on the Implementation of Anti-Trafficking Policies and Interventions in the 27 EU Member States from a Human Rights Perspective, E-Notes, 2009.*

European Parliament's Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality, Policy Department, Citizens Rights and Constitutional Affairs, *Abused Domestic Workers in Europe: The Case of Au Pairs*, 2011.

European Roma Rights Centre, *Breaking the Silence Report*, 2011.

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *The Thematic Study on Child Trafficking in Finland*, 2008.

Finland, Ombudsman for Minorities, *National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings*, Report, 2014.

FRONTEX European Agency for National Border Guards, *Trainer's Manual on Anti-trafficking Training for Border Guards*, 2011.

Groenleer, Martijn and de Jong, Jorrit, *Wanted: Partners, the Challenges of Pioneering a Novel Approach to Fighting Human Trafficking in the Netherlands*, Dutch Public Prosecution Service and the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013.

Heburn, S. and Simon R., *Human Trafficking Around the World: Hidden in Plain Sight*, Columbia University Press, 2013.

International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), *Guidelines for the Development of a Transnational Referral Mechanism for Trafficked Persons: South-Eastern Europe*, 2009.

International Organization for Migration (IOM), *The Cause and Consequences of Re-trafficking: Evidence from the IOM Human Trafficking Database*, 2010.

International Labour Organization (ILO), *Global Estimates of Forced Labour*, 2012.

International Labour Conference, *Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work: From Commitment to Action*. 101st Session Report, 2012.

International Labour Organization (ILO), *Operational Indicators of Trafficking in Human Beings*, May 2009.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation, *Experiences of Forced Labour among Chinese Migrant Workers*, 2011.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. Country reports: France, Germany, Ireland, Latvia, Netherlands, Poland, Spain, Sweden*, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute.

Kloc-Nowak, Weronika, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Poland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013.

Lasocik, Zbigniew, Rekosz-Cebula, Emilia & Wieczorek, Lukasz, *Trafficking in Human Beings for Labour Exploitation in Poland: Legal Regulations, Trends and Countermeasures*, CBSS Task Force against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2014.

McKay, Sonia, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Ireland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013.

National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), *Report submitted by the Romanian Authorities on Measures taken to Comply with Committee of the Parties Recommendation CP (2012)7 on the Implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*, 2014.

National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), *National Report regarding Trafficking in Persons*, 2012.

National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children, *A Report of Modern Forms of Slavery in the Netherlands, Data on Human Trafficking 2008-2012*, 2014.

National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, *Human Trafficking – Ten Years of Independent Monitoring*, The Netherlands, 2010.

Organization for Security Cooperation in Europe, *How to Prevent Human Trafficking for Domestic Servitude in Diplomatic Households and Protect Private Domestic Workers*, OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combatting Trafficking in human Beings, 2014.

Organization for Security Cooperation in Europe, *Unprotected work, Invisible exploitation: Trafficking for the Purpose of Domestic Servitude*, 2011.

Perocco, Fabio, *Responses to forced labour in the EU. National Report: Italy*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, London Metropolitan University, Working Lives Research Institute, 2013.

Pawletta Anne, *Identification of Victims of Human Trafficking in Bulgaria, France, Greece, Romania, the Netherlands and Spain: Good Practices Report*, France Expertise Nationale, 2012.

*Putting Rantsev into Practice: Handbook of Best Practices of Multidisciplinary Cooperation against Trafficking in Human Beings*, Ministry of Security and Justice of the Netherlands, Ministry of the Interior of Poland and Ministry of the Interior of Cypress, 2013.

Raising Awareness and Empowerment against Child Trafficking (REACT), *Summary of Survey Results in Bulgaria, Denmark, Italy, Romania and Italy*, 2011.

Romanian Crime Research and Prevention Institute. *Strengthening the Capacity of Romanian Law Enforcement Agencies to Prevent and Investigate Internet Child Pornography Cases*, Romania and Norway Police Departments, 2010.

Skrivankova, Klara, *Between Decent Work and Forced Labour: Examining the Continuum of Exploitation*, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2010.

Sorrentino, L., Jokinen, A., *Guidelines to Prevent Abusive Recruitment, Exploitative Employment and Trafficking of Migrant Workers in the Baltic Sea Region*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), Council of the Baltic Sea States, 2014.

Tamas, Adelina, Predut, Claudia and Medvichi, Nadia, *Trafficking in Persons for begging, Romania Study*, Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), Swiss-Romanian Cooperation Program, 2013.

Theuermann Gerda , Aronowitz, Alexis and Tyurykanova, Elena, *Analysing the Business of Trafficking in Human Beings to Better Prevent the Crime*, OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, UN Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN GIFT), 2010.

TRACE, *A Review of the Implementation of EU Strategy on Human Trafficking by EU Member States*, 2014.

TRACE, *Report Concerning Human Trafficking, Micro and Macro Perspectives*, 2014.

TRACE, *Report on the Relevant Aspects of the Trafficking Act and its Possible Evolution in Response to Law Enforcement*, 2015.

UNICEF, *Child Trafficking in the Nordic Countries: Rethinking strategies and national responses*, 2011.

United Nations, Human Rights Council, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children: Mission to Italy*, 2014.

UNODC, *Comprehensive Strategy to Combat Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants*, 2012.

UNODC, *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, 2014.

UNODC, *Issue Paper: The Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons*, 2011.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Bulgaria*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: France*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Ireland*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Lithuania*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Netherlands*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Poland*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Romania*, 2014.

U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report: Sweden*, 2014.

Webb, Sarah and Burrows, John, *Organized Immigration Crime: A Post-Conviction Study*, 2009.

### ***Legislation/Court Cases***

Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, Warsaw, 16V. 2005.

European Commission, Global Approach to Migration and Mobility, COM (2011) 743 Final, 2011.

European Commission, *The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012 - 2016*, 19 June 2012, Com (2012) 286 final, 2012.

European Parliament and Council of the European Union, Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, April 2011.

Finland's Act on the Reception of Persons applying for International Protection (746/2011)

Ireland's Employment Permits Act 2006 Section 23

<http://www.djei.ie/publications/labour/2006/emppermitsact2006.pdf> (accessed 22/11/2014).

Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia (Application No. 25965/04 of the European Court of Human Rights), 7 January 2010. <http://www.atlep.org.uk/courses-and-events/training-papers-immigration/guide-to-the-judgment-in-rantsev-v-cyprus-and-russia/>

UN General Assembly, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 15 November 2000.

### ***Websites (accessed between 1.11.2014 – 25.2.2015)***

Animus Association Foundation

<http://www.animusassociation.org>

Anti-Slavery International UK

[www.antislavery.org](http://www.antislavery.org)

ECPAT UK

[www.ecpat.org.uk](http://www.ecpat.org.uk)

EU Directive 2011/36/EU

[http://europa.eu/legislation\\_summaries/justice\\_freedom\\_security/fight\\_against\\_trafficking\\_in\\_human\\_beings/jl0058\\_en.htm](http://europa.eu/legislation_summaries/justice_freedom_security/fight_against_trafficking_in_human_beings/jl0058_en.htm)

EU Strategy

[http://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/doc\\_centre/crime/docs/trafficking\\_in\\_human\\_beings\\_eradication-2012\\_2016\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/doc_centre/crime/docs/trafficking_in_human_beings_eradication-2012_2016_en.pdf)

Cois Tine

<http://www.coistine.ie/home/364-trafficking>

Council of the Baltic Sea States

<http://www.cbss.org/safe-secure-region/tfthb/>  
<http://www.childcentre.info/>

Council of Europe Action against Human Trafficking

<http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/>

Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings

<http://www.coe.int/trafficking>

County Administrative Board of Stockholm

<http://lansstyrelsen.se/stockholm>  
<http://lansstyrelsen.se/stockholm/SiteCollectionDocuments/Sv/publikationer/2015/arsredovisning-2014.pdf>

Employment Permit Act of Ireland (2006)

<http://www.djei.ie/publications/labour/2006/emppermitsact2006.pdf>

European Commission Anti-trafficking

<http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/>

European Crime Prevention Network, Best Practice Conference

<http://eucpn.org>

FRONTEX European Agency for National Border Guards

<http://frontex.europa.eu/training/specialised-training>

International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)

<http://www.icmpd.org/>

International Labour Organization

<http://www.ilo.org>

International Organization of Migration (IOM)

<http://www.iom.int/cms/countertrafficking>

Joseph Rowntree Foundation

<http://www.jrf.org.uk/publications/detecting-tackling-forced-labour-europe>

Migrant Rights Centre Ireland

<http://www.mrci.ie/>

The Netherlands Police Academy  
[www.politieacademie.nl](http://www.politieacademie.nl)

La Strada/CoMensha  
<http://lastradainternational.org/ls-offices/netherlands>  
[www.comensha.nl](http://www.comensha.nl) and [www.mensenhandel.nl](http://www.mensenhandel.nl)

La Strada Czech Republic  
[www.strada.cz](http://www.strada.cz)

Protection Project  
[http://www.protectionproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/100-Best-Practices-in-Combating-TIP\\_Final-Doc1.pdf](http://www.protectionproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/100-Best-Practices-in-Combating-TIP_Final-Doc1.pdf)

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)  
<http://www.osce.org/secretariat/trafficking>  
<http://www.osce.org/handbook/domesticservitude?download=true>

Szczecin Province Police Department  
<http://www.szczecin.kwp.gov.pl/profilaktyka>

The No Project website  
<http://www.thenoproject.ro/expozitie/>

Tulip Foundation, Roma Community Project in Bulgaria  
[http://www.tulipfoundation.net/project.php?project\\_id=885](http://www.tulipfoundation.net/project.php?project_id=885)

UNICEF  
[http://www.unicef.org/protection/57929\\_58005.html](http://www.unicef.org/protection/57929_58005.html)

United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime (UNODC)  
<https://www.unodc.org/unodc/human-trafficking>

UN Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (GIFT)  
<http://www.ungift.org/>