



Preventing human trafficking and sham marriages: A multidisciplinary solution (HESTIA)

*In the framework of the Agreement Nr: HOME/2013/ISEC/AG/THB/4000005845
co-funded by the Prevention of and Fight against Crime Programme of the European Union*

HESTIA Partner Coordination Meeting in Bratislava, Slovakia 28 – 30 June 2016

REPORT

Meeting venue: Austria Trend Hotel Bratislava, Vysoka 2A, Stare Mesto, 81106 Bratislava, Slovakia
Working language: English

Meeting hosted by the Ministry of the Interior of the Slovak Republic – according to the project – project activity 0.6.

Coordination meeting of the project “Preventing Human Trafficking and Sham Marriages: A Multidisciplinary Solution” (HESTIA) (HOME/2013/ISEC/AG/THB/4000005845).

Participants of the HESTIA coordination meeting:

Latvia:

- Lāsma Stabiņa, Project Manager, Ministry of the Interior;
- Larisa Tumaņana, Project Finance Manager, Ministry of the Interior;
- Baiba Balode, Project Accountant, Ministry of the Interior;
- Gunta Vīksne, Project Coordinator in Latvia, NGO “Shelter “Safe House””;
- Sandra Zalcmane, Project Expert, NGO “Shelter “Safe House””;
- Vadims Nazarovs, Project Expert, State Police;

Estonia:

- Sirle Blumberg, Project Coordinator in Estonia, NGO “Living for Tomorrow”;
- Olena Valdenmaier, Project Researcher, NGO “Living for Tomorrow”;

Lithuania:

- Kristina Misiniene, Project Coordinator in Lithuania, NGO “Caritas Lithuania”;
- Monika Murnikaite, Project Participant, NGO “Caritas Lithuania”;

Finland:

- Minna Viuhko, Project Leading Researcher, HEUNI;
- Anni Lietonen, Project Researcher, HEUNI;

Ireland:

- Nusha Jonkova, Project Coordinator in Ireland, Project Researcher, Immigrant Council of Ireland;
- Catherine Cosgrave, Project Expert, Researcher, Training Activity Provider in Ireland, Immigrant Council of Ireland;

Slovakia:

- Jana Mitošinkova, Project Coordinator in Slovakia, Crime Prevention Department of the Ministry of the Interior;
- Miroslava Fialova, Project Researcher, Information Centre for Human Trafficking and Crime Prevention of the Ministry of the Interior;
- Vladimír Koman, Information Centre for Human Trafficking and Crime Prevention of the Ministry of the Interior;
- Veronika Blažičkova, Crime Prevention Department of the Ministry of the Interior;
- Jana Urbanova, Representative of the NGO “Caritas Slovakia”;
- Petra Barnova, Head of the Secretary of the Governmental Council for Crime Prevention.



Meeting results

28 th of June 2016	
till 13:00	Arrival of participants
13:00 – 13:15	Welcome and opening remarks (by Slovak partner)
13:15 – 14:15	Implementation of the project – presentation by Ms Lasma Stabina (LV), HESTIA Project Manager
14:15 – 14:45	coffee break
14:45 – 16:00	Financial issues, documentation, reporting – Ms Larisa Tumanana, HESTIA Project Financial Manager, Ms Baiba Balode, HESTIA Project Financial Accountant

Item 1 on the meeting agenda Progress of project implementation

Project Manager Lāsma Stabiņa provided information about the progress of project implementation, achieved results and material values. She admitted that the project is implemented in line with the project plan.

Project partners agreed on the following:

1. Develop proposals for further implementation of the project activity 0.10 “*Further networking and cooperation plan for a 3 year period*”; proposals should be sent to the Leading partner of the project by 1 November 2016.
2. Latvia and Lithuania may use the national reports developed within the framework of the project activity in order to carry out information activities in their countries.
3. The Leading partner of the project will send a completed final report of the project to the project partners for assessment and commenting. Discussions on the content of the final report will take place at the final meeting of project partners on 16 November 2016.

Item 2 on the meeting agenda Financial issues, documentation reports of the project

The Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Latvia, as a Leading partner for the Project, provides information on the current status of Project budget implementation. In accordance with the Partnership agreements, the leading partner transfers 30% of the Partner’s budget share (minus the Partner’s co-financing – if applicable) to the Partner within 45 days of the start day of the Project; afterwards, if a Partner has spent at least 60% of the advance payment and has provided respective report(s) and supporting documents, the Leading partner transfers an additional 60% of the Partner’s budget share (minus Partner’s co-financing – if applicable) to the Partner. The remaining 10% (or an amount declared eligible minus the amount of the advance and interim payments) of the Partner’s budget share are to only be transferred to the Partner following the balance payment received from the European Commission. Thus, the Partners are encouraged to consider their available sources of funding, taking into account that it is necessary to invest not only co-financing, but also the certain amount of financing necessary to cover the final payment till the moment the Leading partner is able to transfer it to the Partner.

By the moment of the Coordination meeting, the Leading partner has transferred the funding of a total of 467 432.23 euros to the Partners (advance and interim payments have been performed to all of the Partners) within 2015 and 2016.



When analysing the Partners' submitted reports and documentation, the Leading partner has identified that not all of the Partners have respected the following requirements of the Partnership agreements:

- a) not in all cases was a separate Project account open and, correspondingly, payments referring to the Project, performed from it;
- b) not all Partners have transferred (or invested) co-financing.

The Partners are requested to ensure (at least) separate analytical accounting of Project expenditure and ensure separate recordkeeping until 10/12/2022. Besides, the Leading partner has indicated, that in the case that the partner does not invest co-financing in the amount indicated in the Partnership agreement by the end of the Project, in any case it will be taken into account when calculating the amount of the final payment.

In regard to the submission of the quarterly report, the Leading partner has provided information that not all of the Partners submitted quarterly reports for the first quarter of 2016 (due on 15 April, 2016) and made the request to provide the report as soon as possible.

Concerning the progress of implementation of the Project budget, the Leading partner has provided information that the progress differs depending on the Partner: the implementation ratio is starting from 23.23% to 52.01% of the Partner's budget share. The Partners have been invited to reconsider the Project budget positions where savings are foreseen, and to inform the Leading partner on necessary budget reallocations by 1 September, 2016. In the case that the Partner considers, that even with (or without) budget relocations there will be some savings by the end of the Project, the Partner has to inform the Leading partner on the amount of savings foreseen by the end of the Project in order to allow the Leading partner to evaluate the necessity to perform budget reallocation among the Partners. It might lead to a necessity to amend Partnership agreements and refund a certain amount of funding provided by the Leading partner.

The Leading partner has received clarification from the European Commission that within the Project the value added tax is not eligible for two bodies: the Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Latvia and the Ministry of the Interior of the Slovak Republic. The Leading partner has given an invitation to use the "overhead" position for the funding of this type of cost for the Ministry of the Interior of the Slovak Republic.

In addition, the Leading partner has provided information on the common problems, which have been identified during verification of the supporting documents submitted by the Partners:

- a) it is necessary to ensure that job contracts concluded with Project staff (category "A" of costs) correspond to the status indicated in the corresponding budget line, e.g., if the status is "solely employed", the job contract has to be concluded solely for the implementation of the Project. Costs of category "A" cannot be declared on the basis of invoices. If there is an external expert, which is not the Partner's organisation employee, and it is reimbursed on the basis of invoices, these costs are to be reported under the heading "Subcontracting". In this case, respective budget changes have to be performed, which have to be agreed in a timely manner (or least one month before) with the Leading partner and with the European Commission's Project coordinator as well;
- b) speaker's fee is not eligible for the Partner's organisation employees. It forms part of the Staff costs and has to be reported under category "A";
- c) it is not possible in all cases to trace the cash flow till the final recipient. An audit trail has to be ensured!
- d) it is necessary to ensure that contracts for services concluded within the Project and requirements regarding their content have to be respected (see page 36 and 51 of the Guide for applicants).



Presentation "Financial implementation and budget issues_ progress achieved" attached.

As a Leading partner of the project, the Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Latvia:

- 1) Gave a reminder that the partners which have not submitted reports on the 1st quarter of 2016 (which had to be done by 15 April 2016) should present the relevant reports as soon as possible;
- 2) Requested the project partners to review the items of the project budget where saving is intended by 1 September 2016.

29th of June 2016	
09:00 – 10:30	WP 2: Development of the Research Report: results of WP 1: Research and analysis (development of country reports); development of Final Research Report. presentation by Ms Minna Viuhko (FI), HESTIA Project Leading Researcher <i>Discussions</i>
10:30 – 11:00	coffee break
11:00 – 12:30	WP 3: Multidisciplinary Training: Development of Training Methodology and Materials. presentation by Mr Vadims Nazarovs and Ms Sandra Zalcmane (LV)
12:30 – 14:30	lunch
14:30 – 16:00	Continuation: WP 3: Multidisciplinary Training: Development of Training Methodology and Materials. presentation by Mr Vadims Nazarovs and Ms Sandra Zalcmane (LV) <i>Discussions</i>
18:00	dinner

Item 3 on the meeting agenda Development of the project report

Project partner from Finland, represented by HEUNI researchers Minna Viuhko and Anni Lietonen, provided information about the progress of development of the project report. They provided information that the work at the Latvian, Lithuanian and Estonian national reports has been finished. Irish and Slovakian national reports are still being improved. National reports will form a part of the project report. HEUNI estimates that the project study report will be completed by the end of August in order to carry out layout design and publication in September. The total length of the report will likely be around 300 pages.

Experts pointed on main problems in project report:

- Different point of view regarding the term "exploitative sham marriage".
 - Different meaning in different countries, description of the experiences
 - Research report supposed to be the overview that will be used as a base for further researches in this topic
 - Differences between the national reports, difficulties by comparing the data (different kind of data)
 - Preliminary conclusions:
 - Recruitment – who - direct (mostly unorganized) or indirect (through social media)
 - Tactics.
 - Different kinds of exploitative (sham) marriage.
 - Types of exploitation in destination country.
 - The role of organized crime.
 - The role of the third country national spouse – lack of information how they come to destination country.
 - Structure and content of the joint research report.
 - Most important feature is to explore the link between THB and sham marriage.
- Researchers summarised the initial project results.



HEUNI:

- 1) The project study report developed by HEUNI will be sent to the project partners for assessment and comments;
- 2) National reports will also be sent to the project partners for assessment and comments. Comments received from the partners will not affect the content of the national reports.

Project partners agreed on the following:

- 1) The project study report will be entitled "*Exploitative sham marriages: exploring links between sham marriages and human trafficking in Estonia, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania and Slovakia*";
- 2) To evaluate how many copies of the study are required in the English language and send this information to HEUNI.

Item 4 on the meeting agenda Development of training methodology and materials

The NGO "Shelter "Safe House"", in cooperation with the State Police and HEUNI, has developed training methodology. Vadims Nazarovs, representative of the State Police and Project Expert in this project activity, presented the developed training material. Project partners listened and commented on the presented material; it was impossible, however, to hold a detailed discussion on the developed material, as the material had not been distributed to the project partners before the meeting.

Experts presented materials developed by informing about the training objectives, target groups and training topics, as well as offered different working methods. The target group of the training programme are specialists of various fields - social workers, police officers, media representatives, teachers/educational staff, health professionals, staff of the youth centers and social care centers, border guards, librarians, employees of the State Employment Agencies, recruitment office employees, airport workers, etc.

Training programme plan (for a two-day seminar) was presented, pointing the goal of the training programme - to prepare various specialists-multipliers for arising awareness on the subject in the wider society, as well as to initiate awareness on the subject in the whole society.

Content of the training programme:

1. "Trafficking in human beings" concept and purpose
 - 1.1. Key words – trafficking in human beings elements (exploitation, recruitment of a person, trafficking, handing over, hiding, accommodation, receiving), preconditions of trafficking in human beings, Directive 2011/36/EU
 - 1.2. Definition of trafficking in human beings
 - 1.3. Some international documents - Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA (it is important to say that a person may not be held criminally liable)
 - 1.4. Legal framework of each state regarding restriction of trafficking in human beings
 - 1.5. Description of the situation in each state (statistical data provided by the police force, social service providers, statistical data available in the public domain)

Aid for instructors

- 1) Recommended methods of work (a lecture, statistical analysis, case study by identifying the key words of the definition of trafficking in human beings; discussion)
- 2) Questions
 - What is exploitation?
 - Can 3 main trafficking in human beings preconditions be identified in all sham marriage cases?
 - Is it necessary to identify all trafficking in human beings elements in order to speak about a trafficking in human beings case?



Iekšlietu ministrija



- What do statistical data provided by the governmental and non-governmental organizations indicate why there are differences?
 - Has our state adopted the Directive? What are the duties of the state upon implementing the Directive?
 - 2. A phenomenon of a sham marriage
 - 2.1. Key words - types of trafficking in human beings, sham marriages, exploitative sham marriages, a model of a sham marriage process, signs, a purpose of a sham marriage, and means of influence.
 - 2.2. A sham marriage as an aspect of immigration, its purpose - A legal status is obtained quicker for lower costs.
 - 2.3. A sham marriage as a type of business, its purpose - Financial income for service providing. (Selection-recruitment, document preparation, transportation, accommodation, legalization - ensuring illegal residence status).
 - 2.4. A sham marriage as a trafficking in human beings form, its purpose - exploitation; a new term - exploitative sham marriage.
 - 2.5. Common and different aspects, elements of exploitation - control, indicators, exploitation process, signs.

Aid for instructors

1) Recommended methods of work (a lecture, identification of the common and different indicators using a Venn diagram; case study identifying the key words of the topic; discussions; personal stories and experiences).

2) Questions

- What is a sham marriage?
- What are the goals of sham marriages?
- Can all sham marriages be identified as trafficking in human beings cases? Substantiate!
- What is/are the most common scenario(s) of sham marriage(s)?

3. Recruitment mechanism - recruitment methods and the most common recruitment types should be discussed there, showing its process (both at the state and international level).

3.1. Key words – recruitment methods, the most common recruitment types, recruitment process/mechanism.

Aid for instructors - Recommended methods of work (video; TV coverage as an insight into the problem; case study discussion, identifying the key words of the topic; summary of the information in a form of a mini lecture).

4. Identification of a sham marriage as a situation of trafficking in human beings

4.1. Key words – pressure put on a person (threats, use of force, abduction, fraud, deception), activities against the victim.

5. Identification of the trafficking in human beings victim in the situation of a sham marriage - criteria for receiving social services and/or decision making. What is the difference? Why?

5.1. Key words - the main criteria for receiving the aid, the main criteria for criminal proceedings opening, differences, common aspects

6. Vulnerability of the victim, aspects of vulnerability

6.1. Key words - vulnerability, aspects of vulnerability (psychological, social, economic, health aspects, etc.), victim's mental state

7. Support system available to the victims of sham marriages - institutions where to apply for support; what kind of services are provided by each institution; where are they located. How to provide support, how to talk to the victim?

7.1. Key words - needs of the victim, institutions providing support to the victim, inter-institutional collaboration model, and basic principles for providing support to the victim, social rehabilitation service basket, and duration, post-rehabilitation

8. The role of the specialists in preventing sham marriages

8.1. Key words - knowledge, skills

9. Preventive measures to prevent the phenomenon of sham marriage - examples of preventive activities, target groups, etc. Informative films, books, videos, brochures, Internet resources for seeking a job outside the state, info lines, etc.



Iekšlietu ministrija



9.1. Key words - main risk groups (young people, those which come from social institutions, the unemployed, large families, persons with health issues, etc.), preventive activities.

There was proposed to connect theme nr.8 and nr.9

So there will be eight topics in material, to each topic will be offered “key” words which can help trainers. On the second day of the seminar participants are asked to think about preparation of the small information event, for example, to prepare short information for their colleagues or attend youth center or school and give information about human trafficking. Trainers will encourage and will support participants to implement some preventive measure.

The project partner from Latvia, NGO “Shelter “Safe House””, provided information on the following:

- 1) Intention to organise a one-day meeting with the project partners from Estonia and Lithuania in order to continue working at the improvement of the training methodology;
- 2) Not to devote time to the development of the indicators for the assessment of training methodology during the project coordination meeting; assessment indicators will be developed and sent to the project partners electronically for assessment and comments.
- 3) Draft version will be sent by 15th August 2016 and there will be 2 weeks period for comments.

30 th of June 2016	
09:00 – 10:30	WP 4: Advocacy and dissemination of the project results: Further activities of HESTIA Project – the EU Anti-Trafficking Day 18 October 2016 in LV, EE, LT, IE and SK, international conference in Riga Each country informs/presents its planned activities, initiatives, etc
10:30 – 11:00	coffee break
11:00 – 12:00	Presentation by Slovak partner (presentations by Slovak NGO and the Ministry of the Interior)
12:00 – 13:30	Lunch
13:30 – 14:00	Conclusions

Item 5 on the meeting agenda
Project developments in autumn

The Project Manager Lāsma Stabiņa provided information on the planned activities, especially emphasising and setting out her vision of the organisation of debriefing activities and the planned conference in Riga in detail.

Views were exchanged on publicity activities of the project study. The Slovakian partner provided information that a press conference will take place on 17 October in Bratislava, during which a range of national measures aimed at human trafficking will be discussed. The Finnish partner insisted on the need to ensure publicity of the project study within the context of 18 October which is EU Anti-Trafficking Day. The Estonian and Latvian partners confirmed their willingness to organise publicity activities in their countries, inviting HEUNI to participate as a leading researcher of the Project.

It was agreed and decided electronically after the project coordination meeting that the project publicity event will take place in Bratislava within the framework of the Slovak Presidency of the Council of the European Union. Responsible parties: Slovakian and Finnish project partners.

Taking into consideration that on 18 October no activities and meetings devoted to EU Anti-Trafficking Day will take place in Brussels, the Leading project partner – the Ministry of the Interior of Latvia – will organise a press conference



in Riga, during which it will provide information about the developments within the framework of the project and project study.

Item 6 on the meeting agenda
Presentation of the Slovakian project partner

Presentations were given by representatives of the NGO “Caritas Slovakia”, Crime Prevention Department of the Ministry of the Interior, and Information Centre for Human Trafficking and Crime Prevention of the Ministry of the Interior.

Slovakian efforts to prevent and fight human trafficking are considerably serious. The relevant comments:

- A victim (potential) of human trafficking may receive rehabilitation services paid by the State for up to 3 months, if no criminal proceedings have been initiated. In the case of criminal proceedings, a victim (also a witness) of human trafficking may receive the State service for as long as necessary. The State programme involves persons included in the programme in 2011, as the court proceedings are still underway.
- Funding for the rehabilitation of victims of human trafficking is provided by the Ministry of the Interior, which pays for the services ensured by service providers. Service providers in Slovakia are selected under a public procurement procedure – a service is provided by two non-governmental organisations closely cooperating with each other.
- From 2008 to 2015, 210 victims (129 women and 81 men) were identified.
- From 2011 to 2015, 25 victims of sham/forced marriages were identified.
- A hotline administered by an NGO is ensured by the State.
- Close attention has been paid to different awareness raising activities since 2014 – film festivals, and different informative campaigns, for instance, the United Kingdom allowed Slovakia to use its idea of a gift box – a box which looks like a gift on the outside, but tells terrible stories of victims of human trafficking on the inside. The creation of such a box cost 4,000 EUR, and it is used for informative activities at schools, airports, bus stations and different summer festivals.

The representative of the Ministry of the Interior of Slovakia, which also represents Slovakia in the European Crime Prevention Network (EUCPN), suggested presenting HESTIA results at the EUCPN conference in Bratislava in December this year within the framework of the Slovak Presidency of the Council of the European Union. This suggestion is still to be agreed upon with the EUCPN Secretariat in Brussels.

Attached are:

- 1) Presentation “Implementation of HESTIA Project” in the English language on 17 pages;
- 2) Presentation “Financial implementation and budget issues – progress achieved” in the English language on 15 pages.